



<http://www.tayjournal.com>

<https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/tayjournal>

Analysing Social Studies Textbooks in the Perspective of UNESCO's Global Citizenship Education Paradigm*

Emrullah Karatekin, Dr., Corresponding Author
Ministry of Youth and Sports, Turkey
emrullah.karatekin@gmail.com
Orcid ID: 0000-0003-4089-0151

Abdulkadir Uzunöz, Prof. Dr.
Nevsehir Hacı Bektas Veli University, Turkey
uzunozak@gmail.com
Orcid ID: 0000-0002-4130-4612

Article Type: Research Article
Received Date: 19.07.2022
Accepted Date: 24.12.2022
Published Date: 31.12.2022

Plagiarism: This article has been reviewed by at least two referees and scanned via a plagiarism software
Doi: 10.29329/tayjournal.2022.510.06

Citation: Karatekin, E., & Uzunöz, A. (2022). Analysing social studies textbooks in the perspective of UNESCO's global citizenship education paradigm. *Türk Akademik Yayınlar Dergisi (TAY Journal)*, 6(2), 271-310.

* This study was produced from the doctoral thesis prepared by the first author under the supervision of the second author.

Abstract

The aim of this study is to analyse the inclusion of the global citizenship education paradigm (GCED) developed by UNESCO in social studies textbooks. For this purpose, the case study model, which is one of the qualitative research designs, was used in the research. The data source of the study consists of 4th, 5th, 6th and 7th grade social studies textbooks prepared according to the 2018 curriculum. The fields related to global citizenship education in the textbooks have been determined under the guidance of the Global Citizenship Education Paradigm (GCED) developed by UNESCO. The "Global Citizenship Education Review Form" was prepared by the researcher with reference to the publication titled "Global Citizenship Education: Topics and Learning Objectives", which is the first pedagogical guide of the GCED paradigm. As a result of the research, it has been seen that social studies textbooks do not directly include the concepts of "global citizen", "global citizenship", "global citizenship education". It has been determined that social studies textbooks support the cognitive and socio-emotional dimensions of UNESCO's understanding of global citizenship education, but do not sufficiently support the behavioral dimension. Therefore, the goal of raising individuals who feel the responsibility of others and turn this responsibility into action has not been adequately achieved in the textbooks. Another result of the research is that the information that guides the actions of individuals in social studies textbooks is conveyed without prompting students to think critically.

Keywords: Globalization, global citizenship, global citizenship education, social studies, social studies textbooks, unesco

Introduction

The phenomenon of globalization nowadays affects not only states, institutions, and structures, but also societies and individuals all over the world in all dimensions. Due to the different dimensions, philosophical approaches, and past experiences, there is no consensual definition of the concept. Although the concept of globalization started to be used in the 1960s (Held and McGrew, 2003, p. 1), it has a history in Western thought dating back to the Ancient Greek and Roman Stoics (Carter, 2005). It is known that there were many periods in the past when people and societies came closer to each other, cultures fused and economies were in a relationship. The globalization of that period was confined to the experiences of a limited portion of the population due to the political structure and high transportation and communication costs (Keohane and Nye Jr., 2003, p. 78). Keohane and Nye Jr. (2003, p. 75) state that today's globalization has two distinctive features that distinguish it from the experiences of the past, the first distinguishing feature is its speed and the multiplicity of connections. The other distinguishing feature of modern globalization is distance. In modern globalization, distances across continents are more important than distances between regions.

Currently, the most commonly associated field with the concept of globalization is economics. Globalization in this field is usually referred to changes in the capitalist organization of production and society. These changes are expressed as the expansion of a process of capital accumulation that until today has been largely national and limited to the borders of the nation-state (Petras and Veltmeyer, 2001, p. 11). Globalization is also used to refer to the expansion and depth of international flows of trade, capital, technology, and information within a single integrated global market (Petras and Veltmeyer, 2001, p. 11). However, definitions of globalization that are reduced to economic or technological areas are not accepted by globalists. Globalists consider globalization to be a process dominated by interrelated social dynamics,

military, political and cultural spheres (Held and McGrew, 2003, p.7). Increased interaction and its consequences are not limited to the economic sphere but are also a social phenomenon, as Giddens (1990, p. 64) defines globalization as “the concentration of worldwide social relations that link local events in distant regions in such a way as to shape events occurring miles away”. Therefore, today’s globalization is a phenomenon involving complex cultural, economic, and social structures.

With the end of the Cold War, globalization weakened the ability of nation-states to regulate their economies, and non-state structures working together with the economic instruments at their disposal, but independent of them, undermined the power of states by using these instruments (Griffin, 1995, p. 361), raising doubts about globalization. We also see the negative consequences of globalization in the development of consumer culture. Consumption habits are changing as a result of increasing competition with the global economy. Popular global culture, which fuels consumption, causes globalization to be perceived as a threat. Individuals have begun to be identified as consumers, either to find new consumers or among those who are already addicted to consumption, with products that are often personalized or culturally specific (Allman and Wallis, 1995, p. 30). This tendency, which is identified with global culture, refers to the standardization of cultures and homogenization of consumption through the spread of mass goods and economic development (Spring, 2001, p.7). In the 2023 Education Vision document, in addition to the consumer society, other negative consequences of globalization are described as follows;

“...Otherwise, we will all have to bear the consequences of global humanitarian crises such as conflicts and international terrorism, migration movements, environmental and health problems, economic interventions, racism, and xenophobia, to name just a few examples. We cannot accept an understanding of a civilization that overly sanctifies competition by saying “information society”, fuels consumption by saying “technology”, and that excludes everyone except its society when it comes to “humanity” (MoNE, 2018, p. 7).

Raising individuals who can manage the crises and changes mentioned in the 2023 Education Vision has become both a duty and an obligation. In a changing world, there is a need for a new understanding of citizenship that understands both the benefits and the problems of globalization, takes an active role in solving problems, and can adapt to the globalizing world. Citizenship has now evolved into an understanding that is intertwined locally, nationally, and globally (Tuomi, Jacott, and Lundgren, 2008; cited in Tünkler, 2020). This new understanding has led to the emergence of global citizenship and the need to raise global citizens has led to the emergence of global citizenship education.

UNESCO states that global citizenship is not a political identity but a sense of belonging to a wider community and common humanity. UNESCO also underlines that global citizenship emphasizes political, economic, social, and cultural mutual solidarity and interdependence between local, national, and global (UNESCO, 2014). It is an indisputable reality that education systems should review and update all elements to raise individuals with this understanding. Kan (2009) stated that a broad universal citizen model should be drawn in education programs to raise effective global citizens.

UNESCO, which is committed to realizing the goal of raising global citizens, which has become the agenda of the whole world with Goal 4 of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable

Development at the UN level, monitors global and thematic indicators related to global citizenship as standardized metadata. We see the reflections of UNESCO's definition of global citizenship in these metadata. UNESCO's main goals related to global citizenship education, which are determined under the heading "Curriculum Content", are stated as follows:

- Peace and non-violence,
- Human rights and fundamental freedoms:
- Cultural diversity and tolerance:
- The survival and well-being of humankind (UNESCO, 2018a)

Developed countries have made an effort to organize their education systems to raise individuals with this new understanding of citizenship. Especially in these countries, many studies have been conducted on global citizenship and global citizenship education. (Lee, 1989; İbrahim, 2005; OECD, 2006, 2018; Gibson, Rimmington, & Landwehr-Brown, 2008; Schattle, 2008; Ananiadou and Claro, 2009; Gaudelli, 2009; Bromley, 2011; Kotowski, 2011; Moon and Koo, 2011; Oxley and Morris, 2013; Cabezudo, 2014; UNESCO, 2014, 2015, 2016, 2018a, 2018b; Oxfam Institute, 2015; Osler and Starkey, 2015; Young, 2016; Goren and Yemini, 2017; Huo, 2020; Estellés, and Fischman, 2020; Trang, 2021). These studies show that especially since the 2000s, global citizenship has been researched in every aspect abroad. Despite the large number of studies conducted abroad, it is seen that there are not enough studies on global citizenship and global citizenship education in our country. When the literature is examined, there are studies examining the global citizenship levels of teachers, preservice teachers, school administrators, and primary and secondary school students, their attitudes, opinions, and perceptions towards global citizenship, and studies examining social studies, citizenship, and democracy education curricula in terms of global citizenship education and examining the phenomenon of globalization only in the 7th grade social studies textbook (Göl, 2013; Ceylan, 2014; Uydaş, 2014; Çelikten, 2015; Çolak, 2015; Balbağ, 2016; Balbağ and Türkcan, 2017; Durmuş, 2017; Yüksel, 2018; Günaydın, 2019; Özkan, 2020; Akhan & Kaymak, 2021; Kanar, 2021; Türk and Atasoy, 2021). However, it is seen that there is no research in the literature on how social studies textbooks should be in terms of global citizenship education and how and how much global citizenship education is included in the textbooks. Aslan (2016) stated that the education system in general and social studies education, in particular, cannot maintain its traditional structure and functioning in the face of the globalization phenomenon and that change is a necessity. It is important to know whether this change is taking place or not, and if there is a change, which philosophy/understandings in global citizenship education are adopted by the education system in our country. The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, which all member countries have committed to, has goals and objectives that reflect the perspectives of different paradigms. The GCED paradigm developed by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) was adopted as the global citizenship education approach in this study because it gives importance to human and cultural values instead of an educational environment based on competition and does not look at globalization only from an economic perspective. Therefore, in this study, the reflection of global citizenship education on social studies textbooks was examined and evaluated according to UNESCO's global citizenship education paradigm.

Method

Research Model

The present research was conducted with a qualitative approach due to its subject matter and case study, one of the qualitative research designs, was preferred. The most characteristic feature of qualitative case studies is the in-depth investigation and description of one or more situations in detail (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2011; Bloor and Wood, 2006). In the present research, the phenomenon of global citizenship education in social studies textbooks was accepted as a case.

Study Group

The study group of the research was determined by criterion sampling, as one of the purposeful sampling methods. The basic understanding of the criterion sampling method is to study situations that meet the criteria previously prepared by the researcher (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2011, p.112). The criterion previously determined for this research is the social studies textbooks prepared and taught according to the 2018 social studies curriculum.

2018 social studies textbooks prepared according to the social studies curriculum;

4th Grade: Tüysüz, S. (2019). Primary School Social Studies 4 Textbook. Tuna Publishing Ind. and Tra. CO., Ankara.

5th Grade: Şahin, E. (No Date), Secondary School and Imam Hatip Secondary School Social Studies 5 Textbook. Anadol Publishing, Ankara.

6th Grade: Yıldırım, C., Kaplan F., Kuru, H., Yılmaz, M. (2019). Secondary School and Imam Hatip Secondary School Social Studies 6 Textbook. State Books First Edition.

7th Grade: Gültekin, G., Akpınar, M., Nohutcu, M., Özerdoğan, P., Aygün, S. (2019) Secondary School and İmam Hatip Secondary School Social Studies 7 Textbook. State Books Second Edition.

Data Collection

The data in the present study were collected through document analysis. The analytical process in document analysis includes finding, selecting, evaluating, interpreting, and synthesizing the data in the documents (Bowen, 2009; as cited in Özkan, 2019, p.2). There are a series of stages (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2011, pp. 193-201) that should be followed systematically when conducting research with document analysis. Detailed information about these stages is given below. *a) Reaching the documents:* Social studies textbooks were accessed from the eba.gov.tr address of MoNE. *b) Checking authenticity:* Since the social studies textbooks were obtained from eba.gov.tr established by MoNE, there was no authenticity problem. *c) Comprehending the documents:* This is the stage where the researcher gathers information to establish the relationship between the research questions and the documents and to better understand the context in which the documents were developed (Özkan, 2019, p. 32). At this stage, the social studies curricula were examined first. Then, according to the characteristics of the relevant social studies curricula, textbooks were reviewed within the framework of the research questions.

Analyzing the Data

Content analysis, which is used in qualitative research, was used to reveal the place of global citizenship education in social studies textbooks. “Content analysis is an approach that investigates social reality by objectively and systematically classifying, quantifying and inferring the message contained in verbal, written and other materials in terms of meaning or grammar” (Tavşancıl and Aslan, 2001, p. 22). Bailey (1982) stated that documents can be analyzed in 4 stages: selecting a sample from the data subject to analysis, developing categories, determining the unit of analysis, and quantification. These stages of the research are explained below respectively.

1. Selecting a sample from the data subject to analysis: In the selected social studies textbooks, only lectures were included and the table of contents, preparation and evaluation questions, and bibliography were excluded from the analysis.

2. Developing categories: An important stage of content analysis is the category development stage. Categories are structures covering the units of analysis (Baş and Akturan, 2008, p. 123). There are two different approaches to categorization. The first approach is to take an existing category system, and the second approach is to group similar items by determining the differences and similarities of message items according to other items (Bilgin, 2006, p.14,19). In other words, categories are created afterward. Both approaches were utilized in this study. In determining the categories and subcategories, the guide titled “Global Citizenship Education: Topics and Learning Objectives” (UNESCO, 2015) prepared by UNESCO according to the global citizenship education framework paradigm was taken into consideration. In this document, it is emphasized that global citizenship education has three basic dimensions (Cognitive, Socio-Emotional, and Behavioral). According to these learning areas, the inclusion of UNESCO’s global citizenship approach (GCED) in the textbooks was carried out with the GCED Review Form prepared by the researcher. While preparing the review form, the basic student characteristics (p.23) in the UNESCO (2015) guideline, and the age group of the students in grades 4-7 in which the social studies course is taught in Turkey (p.23) were taken into consideration. The “headings and learning objectives” (p.31) and their main themes (p.38-41), the objectives that students are aimed to achieve with global citizenship education (p.16), and keywords (p.43) were utilized.

3. Determining the unit of analysis: Units of analysis can be in many different forms such as words, sentences, paragraphs, etc. In the present study, sentences and paragraphs were used as units of analysis. Accordingly, the frequency of occurrence of categories and subcategories in sentences or paragraphs was determined.

Table 1. *Sample coding from the unit of analysis*

Sentence or Paragraph (Unit of Analysis)	Code	Subcategory	Category
With the development and spread of the General Network, more foreign words have started to enter our language.	Change	National Issues/Problems	Topics/issues
In daily life, some people can use Turkish and foreign words in the same sentence.	Language	National Identity Consciousness	Identity Consciousness/Acceptance

4. Quantification: In the present study, quantification was used to compare global citizenship education in social studies textbooks according to categories and subcategories, years, and grade levels. During quantification, if the relevant category or subcategory was present in the document, a value of “1” was given. Thus, it was determined how many times each category and subcategory was repeated in social studies textbooks. Thus, both the dimensions of global citizenship education and the distribution of categories in social studies textbooks were determined.

Using the Data

Since the data used in the research are public data and the nature of the content of the subject, institutions, organizations, and individuals cannot suffer any damage.

Validity of the Research

The characteristics of the documents analyzed for the validity of the research and the stages of the creation of the “GCED Review Form” used to collect data were explained in detail. While creating the findings, the common features of the findings were written and direct quotations were made from the textbooks. Each stage of the research process was subjected to an external evaluation by two experts and both the process and the accuracy of the products obtained were evaluated and arrangements and corrections were made in line with their suggestions.

Reliability of the Research

Different techniques are used for the reliability of research. One of these techniques is “time reliability” in which the same researcher codes and analyses the same documents at different times (Balci, 2009, p. 174; Tavşancıl and Aslan, 2001, p. 81). In this study, due to the large amount of data to be analyzed and the lack of a researcher who is an expert in global citizenship education and who can code this dense data set, the time reliability technique was used. Accordingly, the researcher repeatedly coded the social studies textbooks according to all categories and subcategories in the “GCED Review Form”, and as a result of this process, a consensus was reached by consulting the expert opinion in the codings where there was hesitation.

Ethical Permits of Research

In this study, all the rules specified in the “Directive on Scientific Research and Publication Ethics of Higher Education Institutions” were followed. None of the actions specified under the second section of the Directive, “Actions Against Scientific Research and Publication Ethics”, have been carried out.

Findings

Analyzing the Cognitive Dimension of UNESCO's Global Citizenship Education Approach in Social Studies Textbooks

The distribution of the cognitive dimension of UNESCO's understanding of global citizenship education in 4th, 5th, 6th, and 7th grade social studies textbooks according to categories and subcategories is given in Table 2.

Table 2. Distribution of the cognitive dimension of UNESCO's global citizenship education in 4th, 5th, 6th and 7th grade social studies textbooks according to categories and subcategories

Categories	Subcategories	4th Grade	5th Grade	6th Grade	7th Grade	Total
		f	f	f	f	f
Issues and Problems	Local Issues and Problems (Identification)	-	1	-	-	1
	Local Issues and Problems (Causes)	-	-	-	-	-
	Local Issues and Problems (Solution Suggestions)	-	-	-	-	-
	National Issues and Problems (Identification)	17	21	27	30	95
	National Issues and Problems (Causes)	-	7	-	-	7
	National Issues and Problems (Solution Suggestions)	6	3	-	-	9
	Global Issues and Problems (Definitions)	1	3	1	9	14
	Global Issues and Problems (Causes)	-	-	-	1	1
	Global Issues / Problems Solution Suggestions	-	-	-	-	-
Systems And Structures	Local Systems and Structures (Identification)	3	4	-	-	7
	Local Systems and Structures (Reasons for Establishment)	-	-	-	-	-
	Local Systems and Structures (Structural Problems)	-	-	-	-	-
	National Systems and Structures (Identification)	15	20	23	23	81
	National Systems and Structures (Reasons for Establishment)	2	1	-	-	3
	National Systems and Structures (Structural Problems)	-	-	-	-	-
	Global Systems and Structures (Description)	-	1	-	-	1
	Global Systems and Structures (Reasons for Establishment)	-	1	-	-	1
	Global Systems and Structures (Structural Problems)	-	-	-	-	-
Interaction and Engagement	The Effects of Global Changes on People	18	13	12	26	69
	Interaction and Interdependence between Local/National and Global Systems	6	11	7	23	47
	Interaction and Interdependence between Local/National and Global Systems	1	-	1	13	15
Cognitive Skills	Critical Thinking Skills	-	5	-	-	5
	Inquiry Learning Skills	3	2	-	-	5
	Media Literacy	1	5	4	6	16
	Digital Literacy	6	11	14	13	44
	Analytical Thinking Skills	4	-	19	7	30
	Decision Making Skills	-	-	-	-	-
	Empathy Skills	2	-	-	1	3
	Problem Solving Skills	-	-	-	-	-
	Technology Literacy	7	-	-	-	7
Creative Thinking Skills	7	2	-	-	9	
Citizenship	Legal and Constitutional Duties of the Individual	1	4	6	3	14
	Legal and Constitutional Rights of the Individual	-	27	19	21	67
	Relationship of the Individual with International Voluntary Organisations and Institutions	-	-	-	-	-
	Rights Arising from International Law Texts	9	6	-	2	17
	Citizenship Approaches/Similarities	-	-	-	-	-
	Citizenship Approaches Differences	-	-	-	-	-
TOTAL		109	148	133	178	568

The cognitive dimension in social studies textbooks was determined as the most common dimension in the textbooks with a total of 568 statements.

In the category of issues and problems, there are a total of 127 statements (22.36% of the total cognitive dimension) in the textbooks. The subcategories with the highest number of

statements in this category are the subcategories related to national issues and problems with 121 statements, while the subcategory with the lowest number of statements is the subcategory of local issues and problems with 1 statement. In the subcategories of national issues and problems, disaster awareness and natural disasters were the most frequently identified expressions with 24 expressions. Conscious consumption was emphasized in the textbooks and it was included in the 4th grade textbook with 7 expressions in total. The expressions identified with the code of disadvantaged groups are mainly trying to gain empathy skills and are included in the 4th grade textbook as follows: *"The woman had difficulty in driving her chair because the pavements were not built by the disabled. Despite this, she was able to get to the front of the ATM, albeit with difficulty."* (MoNE, 2019a.p.27). Current concerns arising from popular culture (consumerism, destruction of existing culture) are included in the textbooks. The fact that popular culture increases consumption under the name of identity acquisition is conveyed by emphasizing both cultural change and conscious consumption. Efforts to raise awareness about how the media is used by popular culture were also included in the 6th grade textbook. *"The most effective tool for popular culture to influence society is the media. Popular culture, television, general network, newspapers, etc. are tried to be placed in the life of society through media tools."* (MoNE, 2019b, p. 250). In the 7th grade textbook, the changes made by changing and developing communication tools in social life are conveyed (MoNE, 2019c, p. 28). Developments in communication technology are conveyed in the 7th grade textbook not only with the changes it creates but also as a need, a basic human right (MoNE, 2019c, p. 31). However, the consequences of not knowing our rights and responsibilities in communication are not mentioned in the textbooks. Technology addiction and committing crimes with the misuse of social media (MoNE, n.d., pp.96-97) are some of the consequences mentioned in the 5th grade textbook. The phenomenon of migration; especially the settlement of educated individuals in foreign countries (brain drain) is included in the 7th grade textbook as a negative phenomenon (MoNE, 2019c, p.113). The phenomenon of internal migration is conveyed not only with its material aspect but also with the cultural interactions it creates. In the 7th grade textbook, the importance of education is another topic covered in issues and problems (MoNE, 2019c, p.111). Expectations from education are conveyed in the 6th grade textbook with a focus on country development: *"Countries become strong to the extent that they transform their manpower into qualified manpower through education. The characteristics of qualified manpower are as follows: "They are entrepreneurs, they love their work."* (MoNE, 2019b, p. 221)." An understanding that sees education as human capital and emphasizes the functions of nation-states in maximizing the employability performance of their citizens is identified in the textbook with these statements. Coups against the democratic order are mentioned in the 7th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019c, p.212), but no explanation is given about the forces that pose a threat to the country's problems. In the 6th grade textbook, the subject of gender is conveyed with the value given to women in our nation, what has been done for the development of women's place in society and the rights provided, as well as violence against women, which is one of the current problems (MoNE, 2019b, p.221), with expressions appropriate to gender discrimination and opposition to violence. Copyright and patent rights were among the other topics covered in the textbooks (MoNE, 2019b, p. 221; MoNE, 2019c, p. 35). The transfer of issues and problems independent of systems and structures is also seen in the transfer of global issues and problems in the 5th grade textbook. *"Some gases released into the atmosphere from industrial plants trap*

sunlight and cause an increase in the greenhouse effect. As a result, the average temperature of our Earth increases. Global warming is the increase in the average temperature of the Earth's atmosphere with the increase in the greenhouse effect." (MoNE, n.d., p. 85). In the 5th Grade textbook, it is stated that fundamental rights are under the guarantee of the Constitution in our country, but they are not guaranteed in some countries (MoNE, n.d., p. 169). Sustainability is one of the other topics covered in the 6th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019b, p. 221). However, the statements focus on individuals and remain in the definition dimension. In general, global issues and problems (global climate change, terrorism, starvation, migration, floods, and natural disasters) were mentioned in the 7th grade textbook without specifying their relationship with systems and structures, and the consequences of some global problems (starvation and migration) were also included in the textbook (MoNE, 2019c, pp. 219-220). Current issues and problems are also mentioned in global issues and problems. Global warming (MoNE, n.d., p.85), deprivation of basic rights at the global level (MoNE, n.d., p.167), and change are among the issues identified in the 5th grade textbook. In the 7th grade textbook, the positive developments experienced during the Industrial Revolution process were conveyed (MoNE, 2019c, p.165-166), but the colonialism in the period and the actions of the first countries that carried out the Industrial Revolution in the global level, which also affect today, were not included in the textbook.

In the systems and structures category, a total of 93 statements (16.37% of all statements in the cognitive dimension) were found in the textbooks. In the subcategory of local systems and structures (identification), 7 statements were identified. Of the 84 statements in the subcategories of national systems and structures, 81 were in the subcategory of definition, and 3 were in the subcategory of reasons for establishment. The continuity and changes of systems and structures were included in the 4th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019a.p.12), the purposes of the establishment and working principles of NGOs were included in the 6th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019b, p. 206), and the missions of NGOs to help, solidarity and cooperation and the goals of supporting existing systems and structures were included in the 5th grade textbook.

In the textbooks, the judicial power and its functioning, the principle of the rule of law, and individuals' access to justice were included in the 7th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019c. p. 208, (MoNE, 2019c. p. 31), and the statements that the decisions of judicial power can be audited were included in the 6th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019b, p. 202). The actions taken against the system and structures are included in the 6th grade textbook with the following statements with the narration of the 15 July coup attempt: *"No matter who uses the authority, the authority in the real sense belongs to the nation, which is the true owner of the will. However, in some periods, illegal groups who are uncomfortable with this authority used by the nation have tried to take over the structures formed by the will of the nation by using force. Such acts attempted against the will of the nation are called coups. Coups are not against the government, but directly against the nation."* (MoNE, 2019b, p.209).

Examples of cooperation, interaction, and interdependence between national and global systems and structures are rare in textbooks. In the 5th grade textbook, the only example of cooperation between systems and structures is the vaccination of refugees who took refuge in our country (MoNE, n.d., p.28).

In the interaction and engagement category, a total of 131 statements (23.06% of all statements in the cognitive dimension) were found in the textbooks. The subcategory of the effects of global changes on people is the most common in the category with 69 statements. In this subcategory, the effects of the globalized world on individuals with the code word "Global Threats and Opportunities" were conveyed in the 4th grade textbook with the following statements "*I am very happy when I receive encouraging letters from local and foreign car designers who like my drawings. Recently, a world-renowned car designer sent me a signed book of his.*" (MoNE, 2019a.p.19). Fairness in global systems and structures and the opportunities they create are also present in the 4th grade textbook with the expressions of children (MoNE, 2019a, p.19). However, the expressions are limited to individual development and competition. It is seen in the 5th grade textbook that technological developments increase interactions between individuals and societies (MoNE, n.d., p.97). The dark side of colonialism after the geographical discoveries is conveyed in the 7th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019c, p.66) and the experiences of colonialism in our country are conveyed in the 4th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019a.p.153).

The effects of conflicts on the lives of individuals are included in textbooks. The effects of conflicts on the lives, beliefs, and other areas of individuals and societies were conveyed both in history (Talas, Malazgirt, and Crusades) and in the present-day Syrian Civil War. One of the code words with the most frequent expressions in this subcategory is the code word "Interaction in Culture and Civilisation", which refers to the contributions of past civilizations to today's civilization. As an example of how widespread the interaction and interdependence between societies is, the following statements can be shown in the 7th grade textbook; "*Like the expression "china", which means quality dinnerware in English, the word "china" is a name derived from the word "China" and is a name given to the Chinese who introduced the art of porcelain to the world.*" (MoNE, 2019c, p.89).

The reality of globalization shows itself in different dimensions in the textbook. In the subcategory of interaction and commitment between local/national and global systems, international conventions created by global systems and structures and accepted by states were included in the 4th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019a.p.153), the interaction between systems and structures was included in the 5th grade textbook (MoNE, n.d., p.28), and the inclusive aspect of international systems and structures was included in the 6th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019b, p. 246). However, the textbooks do not mention the methods that an individual or society can follow when the obligations arising from the conventions are not fulfilled. The only exception is the following statements in the 6th grade textbook: "*Furthermore, citizens can apply to the European Court of Human Rights (ECHR) after using all domestic legal remedies.*" (MoNE, 2019b, p.203). Questioning inequalities in global governance systems is one of the aims of global citizenship education. However, there are no statements in the textbooks about the problems that occur and may occur in global systems and structures.

In the subcategory of interaction and interdependence between local/national and global issues/problems, refugees and conflicts code and current issues and problems were included in the textbooks. The civil war in Syria and the refugee problem were included in every grade level except the 5th grade. For example, in the 4th grade textbook, this issue was conveyed by associating it with "empathy", "solidarity" and Turkish foreign policy. "*Turkey closely follows the Syrian crisis*

just beyond its borders and takes defense measures against terrorist organizations in the region. It also supports international initiatives to protect Syria's territorial integrity and to resolve the conflict peacefully." (MoNE, 2019a, p.181). In the textbook, issues and problems are presented only with their apparent consequences. The causes, their relevance to systems and structures, the responsibilities that global systems and the global community should assume for a solution, and the factors that prevent a solution are not included in the textbook. Similarly, the relationship between the colonialism of the past and contemporary issues and problems is not included in the textbook.

In the cognitive skills category, a total of 119 statements (20.96% of all cognitive statements) are included in the textbooks. The most frequently covered cognitive skills are digital literacy and analytical thinking skills. Critical thinking skills and enquiring learning skills were included in the textbooks with only 5 statements each. In parallel with the increasing importance of developing technologies, especially communication technologies, in the lives of individuals and society, it has been determined that some skills are predominantly included in textbooks.

In the category of citizenship, there are a total of 98 statements (17.25% of all cognitive statements) in the textbooks. It is seen that the statements are mostly about rights and duties and rights arising from international legal texts. In the textbooks, individuals are encouraged not only to learn about their rights but also to demand them, as can be seen in the following statements in the 4th grade textbook: *"However, every child has the right to nutrition, immunization against diseases and quality health care. I expect the rulers of our country and the world to find solutions to these problems as soon as possible."* (MoNE, 2019a, p. 155). However, the textbook does not include legal procedures, methods that can be followed, or what the individual or society should do if the demands are not fulfilled. In the textbooks, fundamental rights are mentioned without any relation to the relevant international law texts (MoNE, n.d., p.169). Although the references suggest that citizenship rights are only related to sovereign states, the statement that individuals can apply to the European Court of Human Rights when they think that the decisions of the legal system in our country are wrong is also included in the 6th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019b, p.203). The 7th grade textbook identifies the understanding of the social state with the principle of equality that protects the rights and freedoms of citizens (MoNE, 2019c, p.208). The principles of the rule of law (MoNE, 2019b, p. 193), the concept of participatory democracy (MoNE, 2019b, p. 204), the right to communication (MoNE, 2019c, p. 33), equality, freedom of movement, freedom of thought, freedom of religion, conscience and worship, and the right to vote and be elected are other rights and freedoms included in the textbooks. The development and change of the concept of citizenship are conveyed through the development and changes in Europe. Citizenship in the feudal system (MoNE, 2019c, p.160), periods when the views of the church were valid (MoNE, 2019c, p.150), the French Declaration of Citizens and Human Rights, and the Universal Declarations of Human Rights (MoNE, 2019c, p.150) and the historical course of this change are described in the 7th grade textbook. Although information about the development of the concept of citizenship is given, today's understanding of citizenship is not included in the textbooks.

Analyzing the Socio-Emotional Dimension of UNESCO's Global Citizenship Education Approach in Social Studies Textbooks

The distribution of the inclusion of UNESCO's understanding of global citizenship education in the socio-emotional dimension in 4th, 5th, 6th, and 7th grade social studies textbooks according to categories and subcategories is given in Table 3.

Table 3. Distribution of the coverage of UNESCO's understanding of global citizenship education in the socio-emotional dimension in 4th, 5th, 6th and 7th grade social studies textbooks according to categories and subcategories

Categories	Subcategories	4 th Grade	5 th Grade	6 th Grade	7 th Grade	TOTAL
		f	f	f	f	f
Identity Consciousness	Commitment to Fundamental Rights	-	8	-	-	8
	The Position of Individual Identity Consciousness in Multiple Relationships	5	10	18	1	34
	The Position of Social Identity Consciousness in Multiple Relations	6	2	8	3	19
	The Position of National Identity Consciousness in Multiple Relations	8	14	37	44	103
	Global Identity Consciousness	4	8	2	12	26
	Sensitivity to Global Issues / Problems	-	-	-	-	-
	Developing Perspective on Humanitarian Issues	10	11	7	25	53
	Relations between identities	-	-	2	11	13
	Forms of Relationship between Identities	4	6	4	8	22
Attitudes and Values	Attitudes and Values towards Diversity and Diversity	32	4	9	23	68
	Awareness of Differences and Diversity	2	1	3	-	6
	Being open to differences and diversity	16	-	-	-	16
Social Skills	Resisting All Forms of Social Oppression	-	-	-	-	-
	Violence Prevention	-	-	-	-	-
	Communication Skills	1	-	-	17	18
	Empathy	9	-	-	-	9
	Conciliation and Mediation	-	-	-	-	-
	Conflict Management	2	-	-	-	2
	Emotion Management	-	-	-	-	-
	Social Engagement	2	-	-	-	2
	Collaboration	-	-	-	1	1
Entrepreneurship	-	3	2	-	5	
TOTAL		101	67	92	145	405

The socio-emotional dimension was included in social studies textbooks with a total of 405 statements.

In the identity consciousness category, there are 278 statements in total (68,64% of the socio-emotional dimension). This category has the highest number of expressions in the socio-emotional dimension in the textbooks. The importance of fundamental rights was included in the 5th grade textbook with the following statements: *“Individuals of a society where fundamental rights and freedoms are protected and utilized live in peace and security. In such societies, justice*

and equality are more easily achieved among people." (MoNE, n.d., p.170). In the subcategory of the position of individual identity consciousness in multiple relationships, a total of 34 statements were identified in the textbooks. The need to define the attitudes and behaviors determined for the individual as the roles of the individual and to exhibit the behaviors expected of them was included in detail in the 6th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019b, p.12).

In the subcategory of the position of social identity consciousness in multiple relations, a total of 19 statements were identified in the textbooks. The subcategory of the position of national identity consciousness in multiple relations was the subcategory with the highest number of statements in this category with 103 statements. The elements of our national culture were conveyed in a detailed and multifaceted manner (offering coffee, kissing hands on holidays, laying dowry). The importance of our religious beliefs in our national identity is stated in the 6th grade textbook with the following statements: "*Our religion has an important place in our acquisition of values such as love, respect, truthfulness, compassion, courage, benevolence, responsibility, fairness, love of homeland and nation.*" (MoNE, 2019b, p. 19). The identification of national identity with the religion of Islam is found in the 6th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019b, p. 18).

National identity is conveyed in the 6th grade textbook with elements such as benevolence, hospitality, and love of animals (MoNE, 2019b, p. 19), which are stated to have existed during the Ottoman Empire, especially through the narratives of foreign travelers and state officials. Under the Turkish identity, "friendship", "brotherhood" and "cooperation" were emphasized. Some of the Turkish-Ottoman identity characteristics defined are as follows: Strong family structure, solidarity in the neighborhood, hospitality, doing secret favors, and protecting animals.

Gender was included in the 6th grade textbook with the importance Turks attach to women (MoNE, 2019b, p.217). The concept of justice was conveyed in the 7th grade textbook by stating its importance as a state custom in ancient Turkish states (MoNE, 2019c, p. 199).

In the subcategory of the position of global identity awareness in multiple relations, a total of 12 statements were identified in the textbooks. Cultures and civilizations outside our borders must be included in the 4th grade textbook with positive expressions. Expressions such as the Japanese's hospitality (MoNE, 2019a, p.191), the Finns' loyalty to their families, hospitality, responsibility, reliability, and honesty (MoNE, 2019a, p.175) are in line with the GCED objectives. In addition, the common points of humanity are emphasized in the 5th grade textbook with the transfer of common heritage (MoNE, n.d., p.191).

In the subcategory of developing a perspective on humanitarian issues, a total of 53 statements were identified in the textbooks. Continuity in culture and civilization, especially the developments in science and technology, was included in the 4th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019a, p.98). These transfers draw attention as a positive approach in terms of understanding the development of today's civilization and not attributing it to a single person or culture.

In the subcategory of relations between identities, a total of 13 statements were identified in the textbooks. Statements conveying the encounters of religious identities are included in the 7th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019c, p.65). In contrast to the hostility of the Christian world against the Islamic world, the environment of tolerance in the Islamic world is conveyed in the 7th grade textbook with the following statements: "*We realized that your state was rising day by day and*

surpassing our state. We saw that the villagers who came under your father's rule were satisfied and did not seek us again, and we were drawn to this comfort." (MoNE, 2019c, p.57).

In the subcategory of forms of inter-identity relations, a total of 22 statements were identified in the textbooks. The place of tourism in relations was mentioned in the 5th grade textbook.

In the category of attitudes and values, there are a total of 90 statements in the textbooks (22'22% of the socio-emotional dimension). In the subcategory of attitudes and values towards difference and diversity, there are 68 statements in total. In this subcategory, language, religion, race, and gender discrimination are strongly opposed in the 4th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019a, p.29). Combating prejudices (MoNE, 2019b, p. 32) and undesirable behaviors caused by prejudices are mentioned in the 6th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019b, p. 27). Inclusion is one of the most common code words in textbooks. Especially in connection with religious identity, inclusiveness is mentioned in the 7th grade textbooks in terms of "living together" (MoNE, 2019c, p. 37), or with past examples such as the "Nation" system and multiculturalism in the Ottoman Empire (MoNE, 2019c, p. 62) and the aid provided by foundations regardless of religion, language, race and thought (MoNE, 2019c, p. 169).

In the subcategory of awareness of differences and diversity, there are a total of 6 statements in the textbooks. To create this awareness, the reasons for differences were included in a narrative transferred from individuals to societies (MoNE, 2019a, p. 193), and in the subcategory of being open to differences and diversity, a total of 16 statements were identified in the textbooks.

In the social skills category, a total of 37 statements (9.14% of all statements in the socio-emotional dimension) were included in the textbooks. Communication and empathy skills are the most frequently identified social skills with 18 and 9 statements, respectively. Examples of the statements in the 7th grade textbook related to these skills are as follows: *"For this reason, every behavior of ours affects our environment. Positive communication behaviors that seem very small in our daily lives can have great effects."* (MoNE, 2019c, 18).

Examining the Behavioural Dimension of UNESCO's Global Citizenship Education Approach in Social Studies Textbooks

The distribution of the behavioral dimension of UNESCO's understanding of global citizenship education in 4th, 5th, 6th, and 7th grade social studies textbooks according to categories and subcategories is given in Table 4.

Table 4. The distribution of the behavioral dimension of UNESCO's understanding of global citizenship education in 4th, 5th, 6th, and 7th grade social studies textbooks according to categories and subcategories

Categories	Subcategories	4 th Grade	5 th Grade	6 th Grade	7 th Grade	TOTAL
		f	f	f	f	f
		Active Citizenship	Individual Participation Local	3	3	3
	Individual Participation National	-	-	-	-	-
	Individual Participation Global	-	-	-	-	-
	Collective Participation Local	2	1	3	-	6
	Collective Participation National	1	1	4	3	9
	Collective Participation/Global	5	1	6	3	15
	Political Participation at the Local Level	-	-	-	-	-
	Political Participation at National Level	-	1	5	3	9
	Political Participation at the Global Level	-	-	-	-	-
	Ethical Behaviour at the Local Level	3	-	-	-	3
	Ethical Behaviour at National Level	-	-	3	-	3
	Ethical Behaviour at the Global Level	-	-	-	-	-
	Planning and Organisation	-	-	-	-	-
	Working in Co-operation	-	-	-	-	-
	Being a Role Model	4	-	1	-	5
TOTAL		18	7	25	14	64

A total of 64 statements in social studies textbooks are included in the "Active Citizenship" category. A total of 14 statements were identified in the local subcategory of individual participation. The statements generally convey examples of individual participation in projects, competitions, and similar activities initiated by official institutions (MoNE, 2019a, p.44). Some examples are conveyed in the 5th grade textbook in connection with the national culture of the actions initiated by individuals with the following statements: "Yasin said, "We see ourselves as deficient in recycling. However, this is a value that comes from our own culture. I want to take our brand abroad to prove that recycling has an important place in Turkish culture." (MoNE, n.d., p.139). The place and importance of systems and structures in individuals' rights-seeking actions are conveyed in the 6th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019b, p.40).

In the collective participation local subcategory, only 6 statements were identified in the textbooks. As it was determined in the local subcategory of individual participation, the statements conveyed not the actions initiated by individuals, but the actions in which individuals were participants in the 4th grade textbook with the following statements: "Narin Sözen Oruç said, "We are trying to give values education to students with the project called "Let Every Class Have an Orphan Sibling". In this way, our children learn tolerance, love, and empathy." (MoNE, 2019a, 27).

In the collective participation national subcategory, only 9 statements were identified in the textbooks. Statements conveying what was done as a nation during our War of Independence were evaluated in this subcategory (MoNE, 2019a, p. 57). The statements convey both exemplary behaviors and actions that individuals can take to improve the world.

In the global subcategory of collective participation, 15 statements were identified in the textbooks. The statements generally convey the work of NGOs in the 4th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019a, 123). The cooperation of national and global systems is included in the 5th grade textbook with the following statements: "With the contributions of the World Health Organisation and

UNICEF, the Ministry of Health of Turkey launched a vaccination campaign for guests (refugee, migrant, etc.) children under the age of 5.” (MoNE, n.d., 28). Global cooperation for the global benefit in systems and structures was conveyed through the actions of the systems and structures of the Republic of Turkey at the global level (MoNE, 2019b, p.242). In the subcategory of political participation at the national level, 9 statements were identified in the textbooks. Although the 6th grade textbook emphasizes the importance of participation in elections (MoNE, 2019b, p.210), political participation is not limited to elections in the textbooks. In the Grade 6 textbook, the prevention of the coup attempt with the actions of the people (MoNE, 2019b, p.209) emphasizes the importance of individual participation at the national level. The importance of NGOs, media, or public opinion formation in political participation is also mentioned in the 6th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019b, p.204). In the subcategory of ethical behavior at the local level, 3 statements were identified in the textbooks. One of the statements identified with the code word “saving” was included in the 4th grade textbook (MoNE, 2019a, p. 141).

In the subcategory of ethical behavior at the national level, 3 statements were identified in the textbooks. The statements aim to raise awareness against the piracy of works such as ideas, thoughts, and works of art (MoNE, 2019b, 151). In the subcategory of being a role model, 5 statements were identified in the textbooks. The heroic actions of women in the War of Independence and especially the actions of women; taking responsibility, and standing up against injustice and inequality are behaviors expected from global citizens.

Analyzing the Distribution of UNESCO’s Understanding of Global Citizenship Education in Social Studies Textbooks According to Dimensions

The cognitive, socio-emotional, and behavioral dimensions of UNESCO's understanding of global citizenship education in 4th, 5th, 6th, and 7th grade social studies textbooks are given in Table 5.

Table 5. *Distribution of UNESCO's understanding of global citizenship education in 4th, 5th, 6th and 7th grade social studies textbooks according to dimensions*

Cognitive Dimension		Socio-Emotional Dimension		Behavioural Dimension	
f	f	f	f	f	%
568	54,77	405	39.05	64	6.17

When Table 5 is examined, it is seen that the cognitive dimension of global citizenship education is the most common dimension of global citizenship education in 4th, 5th, 6th, and 7th grade social studies textbooks with a rate of 54.77%, followed by the socio-emotional dimension with a rate of 39.05%. The behavioral dimension (6.17%) was the least common dimension of global citizenship education in social studies textbooks. According to these findings, it can be said that social studies textbooks support the cognitive and socio-emotional dimensions of UNESCO’s understanding of global citizenship education, but do not support the behavioral dimension very much.

Conclusion and Discussion

The present research was conducted based on the document “Global citizenship education: topics and learning objectives” (GCED) prepared by UNESCO to respond to the guidance needs of member countries in incorporating global citizenship education into their

education systems (UNESCO, 2015, p.7). GCED includes three basic conceptual dimensions (cognitive, socio-emotional, and behavioral) that are common to various definitions and interpretations of global citizenship education. All of these dimensions of global citizenship education are discussed below based on the findings.

When the GCED learning outcomes are analyzed, they include not only the acquisition of knowledge but also its interpretation and critical questioning of knowledge (UNESCO, 2015). The adequate and effective reflection of UNESCO's cognitive goals of global citizenship education in textbooks will show the level of realization of these goals in textbooks.

"Topic and problems" was the category with the most statements in the cognitive dimension in social studies textbooks. Social studies is an important course because it enables children to be aware of the problems of today's societies by focusing on the past and the present (Arin and Deveci, 2008, p. 171). To teach current issues, students need to be equipped with the appropriate tools to cope with the problems they face or will face in every moment of their lives, from local to global (McBee, 1996). In today's world, issues and problems are often interrelated and interactive. NCSS also emphasizes this interaction by stating that human experience is an increasingly globalized phenomenon in which people are constantly affected by transnational, intercultural, multicultural, and multiethnic interactions (NCSS, no date). The emergence of the first Covid-19 case in Wuhan, China on 31 December 2019 (URL 1) shows us how fragile and interconnected our world is, and how important it is to understand the interactions between the issues and problems concerning our world. These interactions and relationships make it compulsory for us to understand the interactions of local and national issues and problems with issues and problems at the global level.

When the textbooks are analyzed, it is seen that national issues and problems are conveyed predominantly, while local and global issues and problems are conveyed less. In all the social studies textbooks analyzed, local/national/global issues and problems were mostly conveyed at the level of description, and expressions about the causes and solution suggestions were very few in the textbooks. The reasons for and solutions to these issues and problems are explained without a critical perspective and adequate mention of the effects of historical, geographical, political, economic, religious, technological, media, or other factors. However, according to the GCED paradigm, individuals need to recognize the engagement with local, national, and global issues, structures and processes. In addition, individuals are expected to question the relationships between contemporary issues and problems with global issues and problems and with existing systems and structures.

In social studies textbooks, interactions and interdependencies between issues and problems are conveyed through global changes affecting culture, negativities caused by the strengthening of popular culture, and refugees. However, refugees are presented only as a result and the subject is associated with "empathy", "solidarity" and Turkish foreign policy. The current Covid-19 pandemic is important in terms of showing the relations between systems and structures with issues and problems. The pandemic also reminded us of the existence of global institutions that had not attracted our attention before, their importance in today's world, and their role in issues and problems that transcend nation-state borders.

The causes of popular culture and the possible consequences of the misuse of communication technologies are included in the textbooks from a broad perspective (economic, technological, media, and culture). The effects of historical, geographical, political, economic, religious, technological, media, or other factors are not sufficiently addressed in the presentation of other issues and problems. Statements at the level of knowledge transfer do not encourage students to conduct research, analyze data or critically approach the information conveyed in the process of acquiring knowledge. When the textbooks are analyzed, it is also seen that the relations of issues and problems with systems and structures are not specified.

When the social studies textbooks are analyzed, it is seen that the subcategory with the most expressions in the systems and structures category is national systems and structures and the subcategory with the least expressions is local systems and structures. The statements about systems and structures in social studies textbooks remained mostly at the level of definition. There are very few statements about the problems of systems and structures. This situation does not allow learners to question to what extent local/national and global systems and structures have been able to fulfill their founding purposes in the historical process and why they have not been able to fulfill these purposes sufficiently.

When the learning objectives in the GCED paradigm (UNESCO, 2015, p.32) are analyzed, the importance of systems and structures in global citizenship education is seen. Therefore, it can be said that there are differences between UNESCO's and 2018 social studies curriculum's views of systems and structures. In the 2018 social studies curriculum, the necessity of systems and structures is emphasized. GCED, on the other hand, aims to convey the interactions and interdependencies between systems and structures, as well as a critical approach to systems and structures (good governance, rule of law, and transparency). The GCED states that the meaning of decisions taken not only in the individual's nation-state but also at the global level, anywhere in the world, for the individual and society should be considered (UNESCO, 2015). However, when the textbooks were analyzed, it was seen that the interactions and interdependencies between systems and structures were not adequately conveyed. We see this situation in the statements reflecting international conventions in the textbooks. The rights gained by the conventions to the individual were included in the textbooks without mentioning the relations of these conventions with global systems and structures. Some of the studies carried out by global systems and structures in cooperation with national systems and structures in our country are included in the textbooks without any reference to global systems and structures. In social studies textbooks, very few statements were identified in which interactions and interdependencies between systems and structures were included. Statements stating that refugees in our country are vaccinated in cooperation with global systems and structures (MoNE, 2018d, p.28) and that citizens can apply to the ECHR when internal legal procedures in our country are completed (MoNE, 2018d, p.203) are examples of these limited transfers. Inequalities and injustices in systems and structures are not mentioned or criticized in social studies textbooks. How can decisions made somewhere in the world affect the current and future well-being of people and the environment? Thinking about this question and its answers is one of the learning objectives of global citizenship education (UNESCO, 2015, p.32). Social studies textbooks do not seek to answer this question and only mention the effects of some international conventions. The effects of factors that influence individuals' perspectives (gender, age, religion, ethnicity, culture, socio-economic and

geographical context, ideologies and belief systems, or other conditions) on systems and structures emphasize another aspect of global citizenship education (UNESCO, 2015, p.34). However, these factors affecting systems and structures are not mentioned in social studies textbooks.

Good governance, rule of law, democratic processes, and transparency (UNESCO, 2015, p.32) are considered within systems and structures in global citizenship education. The importance of the rule of law and democratic processes is emphasized in social studies textbooks. However, transparency, which is a principle related to the accountability and control of systems and structures, was not included in the textbooks. The fact that only the responsibilities of systems and structures are mentioned in the textbooks without stating that they are structures established by human beings for human beings and by human beings and that they can be audited can be considered as a deficiency in the textbooks. Another deficiency identified is that it does not make learners critically question the extent to which systems and structures fulfill their responsibilities.

In the category of interaction and interdependence, the subcategory with the highest number of statements in social studies textbooks is "the effects of global changes on people". Statements in the subcategories of "interaction and connectedness between local/national and global systems" and "interaction and interdependence between local/national and global issues/problems" were limited. This situation prevents students from learning global citizenship issues in the social studies course in a context-based way. Since context-based learning is a learning approach that focuses on the importance of the context of knowledge in real life (Rose, 2012, p. 799), the content of social studies textbooks should enlighten students about why they should learn global citizenship knowledge and how they should use this knowledge.

In social studies textbooks, it was determined that current interactions and loyalties were emphasized in the interaction and loyalty category. However, conveying the fact that today's civilization is not born from a single source can be seen as an important basis for today's cultural uniformization. It is important to explain the existence and contributions of other cultures against the uniformization and consumer culture triggered by popular culture. In the textbooks, interactions with the global world are evaluated from the perspective of the nation-state. In textbooks where the material dimensions of global interactions are emphasized, the approach to education is conveyed with a focus on national development (MoNE, 2019b, p. 221). The textbooks emphasize common heritage and global peace. However, the encounters between societies and cultures are conveyed through wars and conflicts. The interactions of global systems and structures with national systems and structures are presented in some case studies, albeit very few. The importance of raising students' awareness to understand the prejudices caused by the negative situations experienced in the past (colonialism, genocides, wars of economic and cultural domination) and to prevent these negativities from happening again is obvious. However, it is seen that the effects of the colonial period are not sufficiently reflected in social studies textbooks.

The reality that decisions taken anywhere in the world can affect individuals' own lives is not included in the textbooks. The fact that beliefs and values influence social and political decision-making processes at local, national, regional, and global levels (UNESCO, 2015) is another GCED objective that is not included in the textbooks. In the social studies textbooks, the effects of the globalizing world on individuals are described with the code word "global threats

and opportunities” and the opportunities in the education and employment market provided by globalization. The inclusion of current issues and problems in the textbooks with the code word “refugees and conflicts” in the subcategory of interaction and engagement between local/national and global issues/problems will contribute to students following these current events and problems with interest, developing critical thinking and problem-solving skills, better understanding the world in which they live as citizens, increasing their awareness at the global level, and gaining affective characteristics such as tolerance and empathy (Sömen, 2020).

In social studies textbooks, statements related to critical thinking and inquiry learning skills are less common than statements related to media literacy, digital literacy, and partially technology literacy skills. Altay (2020) examined secondary school social studies textbooks in terms of skills and found that critical thinking, decision-making, and problem-solving skills, which are important for global citizenship education, are among the least common skills in textbooks. Demir and Özyurt (2021) examined the achievements in the 2018 social studies curriculum and the activities and questions in 4th, 5th, 6th, and 7th grade social studies textbooks in terms of 21st century skills. As a result of their research, they suggest that social studies textbooks and curricula should be enriched to develop students’ 21st century skills and should be inclusive in terms of 21st century skills. These findings show that social studies textbooks do not sufficiently support global citizenship education in terms of cognitive skills.

UNESCO emphasizes critical citizenship literacy (UNESCO, 2015, p.23), which reflects the change in the concept of citizenship in global citizenship education and reinterprets citizenship. It is stated in the literature that the primary course that can reflect this new understanding of citizenship, which is changing with the globalizing world today, is the social studies course, which has an important place in the citizenship education of countries (Keskin, 2009; Öztürk, 2009; NCSS, 1994. cited in Kuş and Aksu, 2017, p.19). Therefore, social studies textbooks are expected to reflect this new understanding of citizenship in their content. According to the findings of the study, it was determined that in the category of citizenship, the legal and constitutional rights of the individual were given more space in social studies textbooks than the legal and constitutional duties of the individual. No statements were found in the subcategories of the citizenship category such as the relationship of the individual with international voluntary institutions and organizations, citizenship approaches/similarities, and citizenship approaches/differences. However, similarities and differences in different definitions of citizenship are one of the topics targeted to be learned with GCED (UNESCO, 2015). With this learning objective, in which the effects of similarities and differences in rights and duties on today's understanding of citizenship can be examined, it will be easier for us to understand others in our common world with a focus on rights and responsibilities. In Global citizenship education, it is aimed at learning about the similarities and differences in rules and decisions in different societies, and how they are acquired and owned (including history, geography, and culture) (UNESCO, 2015, p.32), rather than simply transferring existing rights and obligations. In the social studies, textbooks examined, efforts to recognize others were made through the transmission of daily life habits, certain cultural norms, or, exceptionally, differences in beliefs. However, citizenship practices and achievements in different geographies are not explained both historically and currently. Democratic political debates and actions are not included except for the actions of the people against the 15 July Coup Attempt. In social studies textbooks, it is stated that fundamental rights are protected by

achievement stories and international conventions and institutions. However, the reality is that fundamental rights are not only under the guarantee of sovereign states but also defended by “the entire human community as a whole” and have to be protected all over the world through global systems and structures (Carter, 2005, p.26) is not included in the textbooks. Social studies textbooks also do not display a critical approach to global systems and structures in terms of violations of fundamental rights.

UNESCO defines the socio-emotional dimension of global citizenship education as “values, attitudes and social skills that enable learners to develop emotionally, psycho-socially and physically and to live respectfully and peacefully with others” (UNESCO, 2015, p.22). Firstly the individual must define himself/herself and be aware of his/her identity characteristics while positioning others in this dimension This is possible with good identity awareness.

Identity, which is an important element of the social integration process, has an important place in social studies curricula both in Turkey and in the world. In the 2018 social studies curriculum, this important topic is covered in a concentrated manner in the learning area of “Individual and Society”. In UNESCO's framework paradigm for global citizenship education, identity is central and emphasized as one of the important foundations for understanding the global dimension of citizenship. In this document, the importance of the individual discovering his/her individual, social and national identity characteristics is also stated and it is stated that in global citizenship education, individuals should learn their own identities and how they position these identities in multiple relationships (e.g. family, friends, school, local community, country) (UNESCO, 2015, p.23). It should not be forgotten that the encounters of individuals and societies with differences and diversity today are much more than in the past. Therefore, global citizenship education aims to enable students to recognize and appreciate differences and multiple identities (culture, language, religion, gender, and common humanity) and to develop skills to live in an increasingly diverse world (UNESCO, 2015, p.16). In line with these goals, global citizenship education that will be provided to individuals from an early age for they to have a correct sense of identity will make important contributions to the common future of the world. It is important how identity awareness is given in textbooks, which is an important part of this education. In the present study, it is seen that religious identity in social studies textbooks in the subcategories of individual, social, and national identity is conveyed by identifying it with national identity. The textbooks also include texts that teach religious identity, attitudes, and values. In addition, efforts to raise awareness of students against cultural uniformization and cultural degeneration by highlighting the elements of national identity defined by religious identity were also observed in the textbooks. Şen (2019), in his research examining the 2018 social studies curriculum, states that this curriculum has shifted towards an ethno-religious nationalism compared to previous curricula.

Studies (Acaralp, 2009) have shown that although we have exhibited the culture of living together despite all the differences for centuries, today we are segregated even within ourselves at the micro level. Education has important duties in eliminating these segregations. However, it is seen in the present study that social studies textbooks do not convey the importance of identity in multiple relationships, which would contribute to the reduction of segregation.

In social studies textbooks, identity is tried to be gained by defining individual roles. There are limited statements in social studies textbooks about developing positive relationships with people from diverse and different backgrounds (UNESCO, 2015, p.35). Statements about the value of different cultures and societies and different perspectives beyond one's own experiences (UNESCO, 2015, p.36) are included at a certain level in social studies textbooks. Multiple identities belonging to and related to different groups (UNESCO, 2015, p.35), which are included in global citizenship education, are conveyed in social studies textbooks. There are also efforts to understand the similarities and differences between societies and cultures (beliefs, language, traditions, religion, lifestyles, ethnicity) (UNESCO, 2015, p.36) in social studies textbooks.

The inclusiveness of religious identity in the textbooks is conveyed concerning the positive attitudes and values that are aimed to be acquired. Confrontations between religious identities are generally conveyed through conflicts, injustices, and negative expressions in textbooks. Even if the statements conveying historical realities are generally true, the only reason for the events is likely religious differences, which may foster negative feelings in students towards others.

Textbooks should convey the interactions with others and the contributions of these interactions to civilization by using positive and constructive language. When social studies textbooks are examined, it is conveyed that civilizations have influenced each other starting from the oldest civilizations (Sumer, Babylon, Assyria) until today. This interaction is explained in social studies textbooks with an emphasis on common heritage and its concrete existence today. How are we connected to the wider world beyond our immediate environment and through different methods (media, travel, music, sports, culture)? (UNESCO, 2015, p.35) The answers given to the question were generally focused on conflicts, trade, and tourism. The goal of gaining an understanding of a common identity potential (a sense of belonging to common humanity, respect for differences, and diversity) is included in social studies textbooks with the importance given to common heritage.

In UNESCO's global citizenship education guideline document, the learning objectives include the goal of "showing respect and appreciation for difference and diversity, developing empathy and solidarity towards other individuals and social groups" (UNESCO, 2015, p.31). As the ultimate goal of global citizenship education, the learning of common values (respect, tolerance and understanding, solidarity, empathy, care, equality, inclusiveness, and human dignity) (UNESCO, 2015, p.36) is emphasized in learning to live together in peace. These aims and objectives show that individuals should have certain attitudes and values for global citizenship education. Therefore, social studies textbooks, which are an important element of global citizenship education, should include content that will provide these attitudes and values. In the present research, a total of 90 statements were identified in the category of attitudes and values in social studies textbooks. The subcategory with the highest number of statements in the category of attitudes and values in textbooks is the attitudes and values towards difference and diversity subcategory. Recognizing others, being inclusive, helping, respecting, and empathy are the most frequently encountered attitudes and values that are also targeted in global citizenship education. It is thought that the increasing refugee population in our country has affected the 2018 social studies curriculum. This situation may be a reason why the common values determined for peaceful coexistence, which is one of the main goals of global citizenship education, are frequently

seen in social studies textbooks. Being inclusive, respect for differences, fighting against stereotypes and prejudice, tolerance shown with our religious identity in the past periods and experiences of living together in peace, and efforts to create awareness about individual differences for social differences are also included in the textbooks. Young (2016) analyzed South Korean textbooks and found similar results. Based on the results of this study, there is an increase in global citizenship themes aiming to embrace cultural differences in South Korean textbooks. Despite this increase, the researcher concluded that children from families with different cultures feel discrimination from their peers in schools. This situation shows that the socio-emotional dimension of global citizenship education cannot be gained only through textbooks and that this education should be handled in a multidimensional and inclusive manner.

Social skills are “the ability to understand the feelings, thoughts and behaviors of other individuals in various interactions, both one’s own and by empathizing and to show behaviors by that understanding” (Çubukçu and Gültekin, 2006, p.167). The skills (communication, negotiation, conflict management, and resolution, accepting different perspectives, non-violence, reconciliation and mediation, emotion management, etc.) (UNESCO, 2015, p.35-36), which are also the ultimate goal of global citizenship education, are examined in this category. In the study, there were no statements about resisting all kinds of social pressure, preventing violence, reconciliation and mediation, and emotion management skills in social studies textbooks. It is thought that the reason why communication, empathy, and entrepreneurship skills are more than other social skills in these textbooks is the developing and increasing understanding of communication, refugees, and employment-oriented education.

The least covered dimension of global citizenship education in the textbooks was the behavior dimension. The subcategories in which there are no statements in this dimension are political participation at the global level and planning and organization subcategories. Considering that learning that does not turn into action and behavior is not accepted as real learning, it can be said that the behavioral dimension, which is an important dimension of global citizenship education, is the weakest point of social studies textbooks in terms of global citizenship education. Türk and Atasoy (2021), in their research examining the 2018 social studies curriculum in terms of global citizenship education, found that the achievements were not distributed in a balanced manner according to the dimensions of global citizenship, and less emphasis was placed on the global participation dimension, which requires behavior. The fact that the concept of citizenship in social studies textbooks is conveyed only in the focus on rights and duties, and democratic political discussions and actions are not included shows that the liberal individualist view is mostly adopted in the understanding of active citizenship in social studies teaching in our country. According to the liberal individualist view, active citizenship is when individuals are expected to remain outside the state and contribute only in a certain way to the reproduction of the state in return for the benefits of organizational membership (citizenship) (Lawson, 2001, p. 166). By learning the types of civic engagement (advocacy, community service, media, formal governance processes such as voting) for individual and collective action not only in one's society but also in other cultures and societies (UNESCO, 2015, p.38), global citizens will be able to strive for solutions to global problems.

Recommedations

1. For an effective global citizenship education in social studies textbooks, it is thought that a balanced distribution of content covering all three dimensions of global citizenship education (cognitive, socio-emotional, behavioral) would be beneficial.

2. It was observed that global interactions of topics and problems were not included in social studies textbooks. Therefore, it is thought that the inclusion of topics and problems with their global interactions in the textbooks will help to better understand today's world problems.

3. Textbooks should include content that will encourage students to develop a critical approach towards the approaches of local, national, or global systems and structures to issues and problems, the decisions they make, and the implementation processes of these decisions.

4. It is thought that explaining the understanding of citizenship in our country by comparing it with the existing understandings of citizenship in the world in the textbooks will enable individuals to better understand the importance of citizenship rights.

5. Conducting the present study, which examines the inclusion of global citizenship education in social studies textbooks, for other textbooks taught at different levels of education would be beneficial in terms of bringing a holistic perspective to global citizenship education in the Turkish Education System.

References

- Acaralp, Ö. (2009). Toplumsal çeşitliliğe bağlı algısal farklılıklar ve kamusal mekan kullanımına etkileri. [Perceptual differences depending on social diversity and their effects on use of public space]. (Dissertation Number. 251502). [Master Thesis İstanbul Teknik University]. YÖK Thesis Center.
- Akhan, N. E. & Kaymak, B. (2021). *Sosyal bilgiler öğretmenlerinin küresel vatandaşlık algıları ve sosyal bilgiler dersinde küresel vatandaşlık eğitimine yönelik görüşleri* [The views of social studies teachers on globalization, global education and global citizen,]. *Milli Eğitim Dergisi*, 50(229), pp. 129-155.
- Allman, P.& Wallis, J. (1995). Challenging the postmodern condition: radical adult education for critical intelligence. In M. Marjorie, M. Mayo & J. Thompson (Eds), *Adult learning, critical intelligence and social change* (pp. 18-34). National Institute of Adult Continuing Education (England and Wales).
- Altay, N. (2020). Ortaokul sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarının beceriler açısından incelenmesi. [Examination of secondary school social studies coursebooks in terms of skills] *Atatürk Üniversitesi Kazım Karabekir Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, (41), 276-297. <https://doi.org/10.33418/ataunikkefd.805054>
- Ananiadou, K., & Claro, M. (2009). *21 st century skills and competences for new millennium learners in OECD countries*, *OECD Working Papers*. OECD Publishing. doi:10.1787/218525261154
- Arın, D. & Deveci, H. (2008). Sosyal bilgiler dersinde güncel olayların kullanımının öğrenci başarısına ve hatırd tutma düzeyine etkisi. [The effect of using current events to success of students and retention level in social studies]. *Elektronik Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 7(26) 170-185.
- Aslan, S. (2016). Küreselleşme olgusunun sosyal bilgiler eğitimine etkileri. [The Effects of Globalization on Social Sciences Education]. *Harran Maarif Dergisi* 1(1), pp. 11-23. <http://dx.doi.org/10.22596/2016.0101.1123>
- Bailey, K.D. (1982) *Methods of social research*. Free Press, New York,
- Balbağ, N.L. (2016). *İlkokul sosyal bilgiler dersi bağlamında öğrenci ve öğretmenlerin küresel vatandaşlık algıları* . [Elementary teachers' and students' perceptions of global citizenship in the social studies course]. (Dissertation Number. 438240). [Doctoral dissertation, Anadolu University]. YÖK Thesis Center.
- Balbağ, N. L. & Türkcan, B. (2017). İlkokul 4. sınıf öğrenci ve öğretmenlerinin küresel vatandaşlık algıları [Global citizenship perceptions of primary school 4th grade students and teachers]. *Turkish Online Journal of Qualitative Inquiry*, 8(2), 216- 249. doi: 10.17569/tojqi.270274
- Balcı, A. (2009). *Sosyal bilimlerde araştırma yöntem, teknik ve ilkeler* [Research methods, techniques and principles in social sciences]. Ankara: Pegem Akademi.
- Baş, T. & Akturan, U. (2008). *Nitel araştırma yöntemleri: nvivo 7.0 ile nitel veri analizi* [Qualitative research methods: Qualitative data analysis with nvivo 7.0]. Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.
- Bilgin, N. (2006). *Sosyal bilimlerde içerik analizi: teknikler ve örnek çalışmalar* [Content analysis in social sciences: techniques and sample studies.] Siyasal Kitabevi.
- Bloor, M.& Wood, F. (2006). *Keywords in qualitative methods*. London: Sage.
- Bromley, P. (2011) *Human rights, diversity, and national identity: Changes in civic education textbooks cross-nationally (1970-2008) and in british columbia (1871- 2008)*. [Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Stanford University, School Of Education].
- Cabezudo, A. (2014). Global education as a transformative learning. *Global Education Magazine*. <http://www.globaleducationmagazine.com/globaleducation-transformative-learning/>
- Carter, A. (2005). *The Political Theory of Global Citizenship*. London: Taylor & Francis Ltd.
- Ceylan, Ş. (2014). Okul öncesi öğretmenlerinin dünya vatandaşlığı eğitimi ile ilgili görüşleri [Pre-school Teachers' Opinions on Global Citizenship Education]. *Kuramsal Eğitimbilim Dergisi*, 7(1), 78-93. <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/1118814>
- Çelikten, L. (2015). *Sınıf öğretmenlerinin küresel vatandaşlık düzeyleri ile öğrencilere aktarmak istedikleri değerlere ilişkin görüşleri arasındaki ilişki* [The association between primary school teachers' global citizenship levels and their views on the values they want to pass on to their students]. (Dissertation Number. 395305). [Master Thesis Niğde University]. YÖK Thesis Center.
- Çolak, K. (2015). *Sosyal Bilgiler ile vatandaşlık ve demokrasi eğitimi derslerinde küresel vatandaşlık eğitimi*. [Global citizenship education in social studies and citizenship and democracy education courses]. (Dissertation Number. 412439), [Doctoral Dissertation, Marmara University]. YÖK Thesis Center.

- Çubukçu, Z. & Gültekin, M. (2006). İlköğretimde öğrencilere kazandırılması gereken sosyal beceriler [Social skills that need to be gained by primary school students]. *Bilig*, (37), 154-174.
- Demir, A.Y. & Özyurt, M. (2020). Sosyal bilgiler dersi öğretim programı ve ders kitaplarının 21. yüzyıl becerileri bağlamında incelenmesi [Investigation of Social Studies Curriculum and Coursebooks in the Context of 21st Century Skills]. *İnönü Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 22(2), 1254-1290. <https://doi.org/10.17679/inuefd.867905>
- Durmuş, G. (2017). *Sosyal bilgiler öğretmen adaylarının küresel vatandaşlık ve çokkültürlü eğitime yönelik tutumlarının incelenmesi*, [Examination of attitudes of social science teacher candidates towards global citizenship and multicultural education]. (Dissertation Number. 477551), [Master Thesis, Amasya University]. YÖK Thesis Center.
- Erkılıç, T. A., Can, S. (2018). Eğitim yönetimi ders kitaplarının içerik ve fiziksel özellikleri açısından incelenmesi [Examination of Educational Administration Coursebooks in terms of Content and Physical Features]. *Anadolu Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi (AUJEF)*, 2(4), 295-307.
- Estellés, M., Fischman, G. E. (2020). Who needs global citizenship education? A review of the literature on teacher education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 72(2), 223-236.
- Gaudelli, W. (2009). Heuristics of global citizenship discourses towards curriculum enhancement. *Journal of Curriculum Theory*, 25(1), 68-85.
- Gibson, K. L., Rimmington, G. M. & Landwehr-Brown, M. (2008). Developing global awareness and responsible world citizenship with global learning. *Roeper Review*, 30(1), 11-23.
- Giddens, A. (1990). *The consequences of modernity*. Cambridge: Polity Press in association with Blackwell Publishers Ltd.
- Göl, E. (2013). *Sosyal bilgiler öğretmen adaylarının küresel vatandaşlık tutum düzeylerinin farklı değişkenler açısından incelenmesi* [The examination of global citizenship attitude levels of social studies nominee instructors according to different variants]. (Dissertation Number. 348889), [Master Thesis, Ahi Evran University]. YÖK Thesis Center.
- Goren, H. & Yemini, M. (2017). Global citizenship education redefined – A systematic review of empirical studies on global citizenship education. *International Journal of Educational Research*. (82), 170-183.
- Griffin, K. (1995). Global prospects for development and human security/. *Revue Canadienne D'etudes Du Developpment*. *Canadian Journal of development*, 16(3), 359-370. doi:10.1080/02255189.1995.9669608
- Günaydın, H. (2019). *Okul yöneticilerinin küresel vatandaşlık tutumlarının incelenmesi* [Examination of school principal's global citizenship attitudes]. [Dissertation Number. 564340], [Master Thesis, Eskişehir Osmangazi University]. YÖK Thesis Center.
- Held, D. & McGrew, A. (2003). D. Held ve A. McGrew (Dü) In *the global transformations reader an introduction to the the great globalization debate: An introduction*. Cambridge: Polity Press in association with Blackwell Publishing Ltd.
- Huo, Y. (2020) Comparative global citizenship education: A critical literature analysis *Beijing International Review of Education* 2(4), 537-552.
- Ibrahim, T. (2005). Global citizenship education: Mainstreaming the curriculum? *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 35(2), 177-194.
- Kan, Ç. (2009). Değişen Değerler ve Küresel Vatandaşlık Eğitimi [Changing values and global citizenship education]. *Kastamonu Eğitim Dergisi*, 17(3), 895-904.
- Kanar, H.B. (2021). *Sosyal bilgiler öğretmen adaylarının değer tercihlerinin küresel vatandaşlık düzeylerine etkisi* [The effect of social studies teacher candidates' value judgments on global citizenship levels]. (Dissertation Number. 680443), [Master Thesis, Eskişehir Osmangazi University]. YÖK Thesis Center.
- Keohane, R., & Nye Jr., J. (2003). Globalization: what's new? what's not? (and so what?) D. Held, & A. McGrew (Dü) In *the global transformations reader an introduction to the globalization debate*. Polity Press in association with Blackwell Publishing Ltd.
- Kotowski, J.M.(2011). *The discursive construction of national identities through narratives of immigration in german and american social studies textbooks*, Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, University Of California, Politics.

- Kuş, Z. & Aksu, A. (2017). Vatandaşlık ve vatandaşlık eğitimi hakkında sosyal bilgiler öğretmenlerinin inançları [Social studies teachers' beliefs on citizenship and citizenship education]. *Uluslararası Türk Eğitim Bilimleri Dergisi* (8), 18-41.
- Lawson, H. (2001). Active citizenship in schools and the community. *Curriculum Journal* 12 (2), 163-178.
- Lee, S. A (1989). *Middle school social studies textbooks in michigan: A description of cultural and global perspectives*. [Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Michigan State University], Department of Teacher Education.
- Lee, S. S. (2020). Fostering "global citizens"? Trends in global awareness, agency, and competence in textbooks worldwide 1950–2011. *Prospects*. (48), 215-236.
- McBee, R. (1996). Can controversial topics be taught in the early years? The answer is Yes! *Social Education*, 60(1), 38-41.
- Ministry of National Education (MoNE), (tarih yok). *Ortaokul ve imam hatip ortaokulu sosyal bilgiler 5 ders kitabı* [Secondary school and imam hatip secondary school social studies 5 grades. textbooks]. Anadol.
- Ministry of National Education (MoNE), (2018). 2023 eğitim vizyonu. [2023 education vision]. http://2023vizyonu.meb.gov.tr/doc/2023_EGITIM_VIZYONU.pdf adresinden alındı.
- Ministry of National Education (MoNE), (2019a). *İlkokul sosyal bilgiler 4 ders kitabı*. [Secondary school social studies 4 grade textbook]. Ankara: Tuna Matbaacılık San. ve Tic. A.Ş.
- Ministry of National Education (MoNE), (2019b). [Secondary school and imam hatip secondary school social studies 6 grades. textbooks]. Devlet Kitapları Birinci Baskı.
- Ministry of National Education (MoNE), (2019c). *Ortaokul ve imam hatip ortaokulu sosyal bilgiler 7 ders kitabı* [Secondary school and imam hatip secondary school social studies 7 grades. textbooks]. Devlet Kitapları İkinci Baskı.
- Moon, R. J. & Koo, J.-W. (2011). Global citizenship and human rights: a longitudinal analysis of social studies and ethics textbooks in the republic of korea. *Comparative Education Review*, 55(4), 574–599.
- National Council for the Social Studies NCSS. (tarih yok). <https://www.socialstudies.org/position-statements/global-and-internationaleducation-social-studies>
- OECD. (2006). *Education policy analysis 2006*. https://read.oecd-ilibrary.org/education/education-policy-analysis-2006_epa-2006-en#page61 adresinden alındı.
- Osler, A. & Starkey, H. (2015). Education for cosmopolitan citizenship: A framework for language learning. *Argentinian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 3(2), 30-39.
- Oxfam. (2015). *Education for global citizenship: a guide for schools*. 05 03, 2020 tarihinde Education for Global Citizenship- Oxfam GB: oxfam.org.uk adresinden alındı
- Oxley, L., & Morris, P. (2013). Global citizenship: A typology for distinguishing its multiple conceptions. *British Journal of Educational Studies*, 61(3), 301-325.
- Özkan, U. B. (2019). *Eğitim bilimleri araştırmaları için doküman inceleme yöntemleri* [Document analysis methods for educational science research]. Ankara: Pegem Akademi.
- Özkan, S. (2020). *Sınıf öğretmenlerinin sosyal bilgiler dersine ilişkin tutumları ve küresel vatandaşlık görüşleri arasındaki ilişkinin incelenmesi* [Examination of the relationship between classroom teachers' attitudes towards social studies course and opinions about global citizenship]. (Dissertation Number. 624771), [Master Thesis, Zonguldak Bülent Ecevit University]. YÖK Thesis Center
- Petras, J., & Veltmeyer, H. (2001). *Globalization unmasked imperialism in the 21 st century*. New York: Zed Books Ltd.
- Rose, D. E. (2012). Context-based learning. N. M. Seel (Ed), *Encyclopedia of the sciences of learning* içinde (s. 799–802). New York: Springer.
- Schattle, H. (2008). Education for global citizenship: Illustrations of ideological pluralism and adaptation. *Journal of Political Ideologies*, 13(1), 73-94.

- Sömen, T. (2020). Sosyal bilgiler öğretiminde güncel olaylar. [Current events in social studies teaching]. *Atatürk Üniversitesi Kazım Karabekir Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, (41), 431-447.
- Spring, J. (2001). Globalization and Educational Rights an Intercivilizational Analysis.
- Şen, A. (2019). Vatandaşlık eğitiminde değişiklik ve süreklilikler: 2018 sosyal bilgiler öğretim programı nasıl bir vatandaşlık eğitimi öngörüyor? [Changes and continuities in citizenship education: What kind of citizenship education does the 2018 social studies curriculum envisage?] *Eğitimde Nitel Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 7(1), 1-28.
- Tavşancıl, E. & Aslan, A. (2001). *Sözel yazılı ve diğer materyaller için içerik analizi ve uygulama örnekleri.* [Content analysis and application examples for oral, written and other materials]. İstanbul: Epsilon.
- Trang, P. T. T. (2021). Understanding of global citizenship among higher education teachers: Implications for graduate attributes. *Education Quarterly Reviews*, 4(4), 199-210.
- Tünkler, V. (2020). Sosyal bilgiler öğretmenlerinin küresel, çokkültürlü eğitime ve küresel vatandaşlık eğitimine yönelik bakış açıları. [Social studies teachers' perspectives on global, multicultural education and global citizenship education] *Milli Eğitim*, 49(226), 255-290.
- Türk, H. & Atasoy, E. (2021). Sosyal bilgiler dersi öğretim programının (2018) küresel vatandaşlık açısından değerlendirilmesi. [Evaluation of the social studies course curriculum (2018) in terms of global citizenship.] *Milli Eğitim Dergisi*, 50(230) 147-167.
- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) (2014a). Global citizenship education. preparing learners for the challenges of the twenty-first century. France. http://www.eunec.eu/sites/www.eunec.eu/files/attachment/files/global_citizenship_education_report..pdf adresinden alındı
- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) (2014b). Global citizenship education. Preparing learners for the challenges of the twenty-first century. Erişim adresi: [http://www.eunec.eu/sites/www.eunec.eu/files/attachment/files/global_citizen ship_education_report..pdf](http://www.eunec.eu/sites/www.eunec.eu/files/attachment/files/global_citizen_ship_education_report..pdf)
- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) (2015). Global citizenship education: Topics and learning objectives. Erişim adresi: <https://gcedclearinghouse.org/sites/default/files/resources/150020eng.pdf>
- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) (2016). *Education 2030: Incheon declaration and framework for action towards inclusive and equitable quality education and lifelong learning for all*. Erişim adresi: <https://iite.unesco.org/publications/education-2030-incheondeclaration-framework-action-towards-inclusive-equitable-quality-educationlifelong-learning/>
- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) (2018a). *Metadata for the global and thematic indicators for the follow-up and review of SDG 4 and education 2030*. Erişim adresi http://uis.unesco.org/sites/default/files/documents/metadata-global-thematicindicators-sdg4-education2030-2017-en_1.pdf
- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) (2018b). *Global citizenship education: Taking it local*. Erişim adresi: <https://www.gcedclearinghouse.org/resources/global-citizenship-educationtaking-it-local?language=enURL> 1. (<https://www.who.int/news-room/detail/29-06-2020-covidtimeline>)
- Uydaş, İ. (2014). *Ortaöğretim öğrencilerinin küresel vatandaşlık bağlamında çokkültürlülük hakkındaki görüşlerinin değerlendirilmesi (Çanakkale ili örneği)*, [Evaluation high school students' views on multiculturalism within the framework global citizenship] (Dissertation Number. 375607), [Master Thesis, Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University]. YÖK Thesis Center
- Yıldırım, A. & Şimşek, H. (2011). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri [Qualitative research methods in the social sciences]*. Seçkin
- Young, H. H. (2016) Challenges and tasks of global citizenship education in east Asia: assimilation policy of multicultural family students in south korea. *Revista española de educación comparada*, 28, 53-71.

Yüksel, A. (2018). *Öğretmenlerin çokkültürlü yeterlik algılarının küresel vatandaşlık algıları üzerine etkisi ve kültürel zekânın bu ilişki üzerindeki aracı etkisinin belirlenmesi. [The impact of the teachers' multicultural competence perceptions on the global citizenship perceptions and determination of the mediator effect of cultural intelligence on this relationship].* (Dissertation Number. 528011), [Doctoral Dissertation, Gazi University]. YÖK Thesis Center

BIOGRAPHICAL NOTES

Contribution Rate of Researchers

Author 1: 50%

Author 2: 50%

Conflict Statement

There is no financial or individual organic link with the person or institution involved in the research.

Genişletilmiş Türkçe Özet



<http://www.tayjournal.com>

<https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/tayjournal>

Sosyal Bilgiler Ders Kitaplarının UNESCO'nun Küresel Vatandaşlık Eğitim Paradigması Açısından İncelenmesi

Giriş

Küreselleşme olgusu günümüzde tüm dünyada her boyutu ile sadece devletleri, kurum ve yapıları değil toplumları ve bireyleri de etkilemektedir. Günümüzde küreselleşme kavramının en fazla ilişkilendirildiği alan ekonomidir. Ancak artan etkileşim ve bunun sonuçlarının sadece ekonomi alanı ile sınırlı olmadığını aynı zamanda toplumsal bir olgu olduğunu Giddens (1990, s. 64)'ın "Uzak bölgelerdeki yerel olayları kilometrelerce uzakta meydana gelen olaylarla şekillendirecek şekilde birbirine bağlayan dünya çapında sosyal ilişkilerin yoğunlaşması" olarak ifade ettiği küreselleşme tanımında da görmekteyiz. Dolayısıyla günümüz küreselleşmesi karmaşık kültürel, ekonomik ve toplumsal yapıları ilgilendiren bir olgudur.

Değişen dünya ile küreselleşmenin hem faydalarını hem de ortaya çıkardığı sorunları bilen, sorunların çözümünde aktif rol alan, küresel bir köye dönüşmüş dünyamıza uyum sağlayabilen yeni bir vatandaşlık anlayışına olan ihtiyaç küresel vatandaşlık kavramının; küresel vatandaşlar yetiştirme ihtiyacı da küresel vatandaşlık eğitimi kavramının ortaya çıkmasına neden olmuştur. Günümüzde vatandaşlık, yerel, ulusal ve küresel olarak iç içe geçmiş (Tuomi, Jacott ve Lundgren, 2008; akt: Tünkler, 2020) bir anlayışa evrilmiştir. United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) küresel vatandaşlığı siyasi bir kimlik olarak değil, daha geniş bir topluluğa ve ortak insanlığa ait olma duygusu olduğunu belirterek; yerel, ulusal ve küresel arasındaki politik, ekonomik, sosyal ve kültürel karşılıklı dayanışmayı ve birbirine bağlılığı vurguladığının altını çizmektedir (UNESCO, 2014). Bu anlayışa sahip bireylerin yetiştirilmesi için eğitim sistemlerinin tüm unsurlarını gözden geçirmesi ve güncellemesi tartışılmaz bir gerçekliktir.

Gelişmiş ülkeler; eğitim sistemlerini bu yeni vatandaşlık anlayışına uygun bireyler yetiştirmek için bir düzenleme çabası içerisine girmişler ve özellikle bu ülkelerde küresel

vatandaşlık ve küresel vatandaşlık eğitimi konusunda birçok araştırma yapılmıştır. Yurt dışında yapılan çok sayıda araştırmaya karşın ülkemizde küresel vatandaşlık, küresel vatandaşlık eğitimi ile ilgili yeterli çalışmanın olmadığı görülmektedir. Literatürde sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarının küresel vatandaşlık eğitimi açısından nasıl olması gerektiği ve ders kitaplarının küresel vatandaşlık eğitimine nasıl ve ne kadar yer verildiğine dair herhangi bir araştırmanın olmadığı görülmektedir.

Küresel vatandaşlık eğitimi anlayışları arasında BM'ye bağlı bir kurum olarak 1946 yılında kurulan "Birleşmiş Milletler Eğitim, Bilim ve Kültür Örgütü (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) tarafından geliştirilen Global Citizenship Education Paradigm (GCED) (Küresel Vatandaşlık Eğitim Paradigması), rekabete dayalı bir eğitim ortamı yerine insani ve kültürel değerlere önem vermesi ve küreselleşmeye sadece ekonomik boyutu ile bakmaması nedenleri ile bu araştırmada küresel vatandaşlık eğitim anlayışı olarak benimsenmiştir. Bu araştırmada da küresel vatandaşlık eğitiminin sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarına olan yansımaları UNESCO'nun küresel vatandaşlık eğitimi paradigmasına göre incelenmiş ve değerlendirilmiştir.

Yöntem

Bu araştırma konusu gereği nitel bir yaklaşımla yürütülmüş ve nitel araştırma desenlerinden durum çalışması tercih edilmiştir. Bu araştırmada sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında küresel vatandaşlık eğitimi olgusu bir durum olarak kabul edilmiştir.

Araştırmanın çalışma grubu belirlenirken amaçlı örnekleme yöntemlerinden birisi olan ölçüt örnekleme tercih edilmiştir. Bu araştırma için önceden tespit edilen ölçüt 2018 sosyal bilgiler dersi öğretim programına göre hazırlanmış ve okutulmakta olan sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarıdır.

Araştırmada veriler sistemli bir şekilde doküman incelemesi yoluyla toplanmıştır. Öncelikle analiz edilecek sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarına MEB'in eba.gov.tr adresinden erişilmiştir. Bundan dolayı dokümanlarda bir orijinallik sorunu yaşanmamıştır. Dokümanların daha iyi anlaşılması için sosyal bilgiler dersi öğretim programları incelenmiş ve ders kitapları araştırma soruları çerçevesinde gözden geçirilmiştir.

Küresel vatandaşlık eğitiminin sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarındaki yerini ortaya koymak için nitel araştırmalarda kullanılan içerik analizinden yararlanılmıştır. Kategoriler ve alt kategorilerin belirlenmesinde UNESCO'nun küresel vatandaşlık eğitimi çerçeve paradigmasına göre hazırladığı "Global Citizenship Education: Topics and Learning Objectives" (UNESCO, 2015) başlıklı kılavuz dikkate alınmıştır. Bu dokümanda küresel vatandaşlık eğitiminin üç temel boyutu (Bilişsel, Sosyo-Duygusal, Davranışsal) olduğu vurgulanmıştır. Bu öğrenme alanlarına göre, UNESCO'nun küresel vatandaşlık yaklaşımının (GCED) ders kitaplarında yer alma durumu araştırmacı tarafından hazırlanmış olan GCED İnceleme Formu ile gerçekleştirilmiştir.

Araştırmanın geçerliği

Araştırmanın geçerliği için incelenen dokümanların özellikleri ile veri toplamak için kullanılan "GCED İnceleme Formu" nun oluşturulma safhaları detaylı bir şekilde açıklanmıştır. Bulgular oluşturulurken bulguların ortak özellikleri açıkça yazılarak ders kitaplarından doğrudan

alıntılar yapılmıştır. Araştırma sürecinin her aşaması iki uzman tarafından bir dış değerlendirmeye tabi tutulmuştur.

Araştırmanın Güvenirliği

Bu araştırmada analiz edilecek verilerin çokluğu, küresel vatandaşlık eğitimi konusunda uzman olan ve bu yoğun veri setini kodlayacak bir araştırmacının bulunamayışından dolayı zaman açısından güvenilirlik tekniği kullanılmıştır. Buna göre araştırmacı defaatle sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarını “GCED İnceleme Formunda” yer alan tüm kategori ve alt kategorilere göre kodlamış ve bu süreç sonucunda tereddüt yaşanan kodlamalarda uzman görüşüne başvurularak bir görüş birliğine varılmıştır.

Araştırmanın Etik İzinleri

Yapılan bu çalışmada “Yükseköğretim Kurumları Bilimsel Araştırma ve Yayın Etiği Yönergesi” kapsamında uyulması belirtilen tüm kurallara uyulmuştur. Yönergenin ikinci bölümü olan “Bilimsel Araştırma ve Yayın Etiğine Aykırı Eylemler” başlığı altında belirtilen eylemlerden hiçbiri gerçekleştirilmemiştir.

Bulgular

Sosyal Bilgiler Ders Kitaplarında UNESCO’nun Küresel Vatandaşlık Eğitimi Anlayışının Bilişsel Boyutunun İncelenmesi

Sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında bilişsel boyut, toplam 568 ifade ile ders kitaplarında en fazla yer alan boyut olarak belirlenmiştir.

Konular ve sorunlar kategorisinde ders kitaplarında toplamda 127 (Tüm bilişsel boyutun %22,36’sı) ifade yer almaktadır. Bu kategoride en fazla ifadenin yer aldığı alt kategoriler 121 ifade ile ulusal konular ve sorunlar ile ilgili alt kategoriler iken en az ifadenin yer aldığı alt kategori ise 1 ifade ile yerel konular ve sorunlar alt kategorisidir. Ulusal konu ve sorunlar alt kategorilerinde afet bilinci ve doğal afetlerin aktarıldığı ifadeler 24 ifade ile en sık belirlenen ifadeler olmuştur.

Sistemler ve yapılar kategorisinde ders kitaplarında toplamda 93 ifade (Tüm bilişsel boyuttaki ifadelerin %16,37’si) yer almaktadır. Yerel sistemler ve yapılar (tanımlama) alt kategorisinde 7 ifade belirlenmiştir. Ulusal sistemler ve yapılar alt kategorilerinde belirlenen 84 ifadenin 81 adedi tanımlama alt kategorisinde, 3 tanesi ise kurulma nedenleri alt kategorisindedir. Sistem ve yapıların sürekliliği ve değişimleri 4.sınıf ders kitabında (MEB, 2019a.s.12), STK’ların kurulma amaçları ve çalışma ilkeleri 6.sınıf ders kitabında (MEB, 2019b, s. 206), STK’ların yardımlaşma, dayanışma ve işbirliği misyonları ile var olan sistem ve yapılara destek olma hedefleri ise 5.sınıf ders kitabında yer almıştır. Ders kitaplarında ulusal ile küresel sistem ve yapılar arasındaki işbirliği, etkileşim ve bağlılık örnekleri azdır.

Etkileşim ve bağlılık kategorisinde ders kitaplarında toplamda 131 ifade (Tüm bilişsel boyuttaki ifadelerin % 23,06’sı) yer almaktadır. Küresel değişimlerin insanlar üzerindeki etkileri alt kategorisi 69 ifade ile kategoride en sık yer alan alt kategoridir. Bu alt kategoride “Küresel Tehdit ve Fırsatlar” kod kelimesi ile küreselleşen dünyanın bireylere etkileri 4.sınıf ders kitabında aktarılmıştır (MEB, 2019a.s.19). Küresel sistem ve yapılardaki adalet ve yarattığı fırsatlar yine çocukların ifadeleri ile 4.sınıf ders kitabında mevcuttur (MEB, 2019a, s.19).

Küreselleşme gerçeği ders kitabında kendini farklı boyutlarda göstermektedir. Yerel/ulusal ile küresel sistemler arasındaki etkileşim ve bağlılık alt kategorisinde küresel sistem ve yapılarca oluşturulan ve devletler tarafından kabul edilen uluslararası sözleşmeler 4.sınıf ders kitabında, (MEB, 2019a.s.153), sistem ve yapılar arasında etkileşim ulusal ve küresel sistemlerin ortaklaşa yaptıkları çalışma 5.sınıf ders kitabında (MEB, t.y., s.28), uluslararası sistem ve yapıların kapsayıcı yönü ise 6.sınıf ders kitabında (MEB, 2019b, s. 246) yer almıştır. Fakat ders kitaplarında sözleşmelerden doğan yükümlülüklerin yerine getirilmediğinde bireyin ya da toplumun izleyebilecekleri yöntemlere değinilmemiştir.

Ders kitabında, konular ve sorunlar sadece görünen sonuçları ile aktarılmıştır. Nedenleri, sistem ve yapılarla ilgileri, çözüm için küresel sistemler ve küresel toplumun üstlenmesi gereken sorumluluklar ve çözüme engel olan faktörler ders kitabında bulunmamaktadır. Benzeri şekilde geçmiş dönem sömürgeciliğinin günümüz konu ve sorunları ile ilişkileri de ders kitabında yer almamaktadır.

Bilişsel beceriler kategorisinde ders kitaplarında toplamda 119 ifade (Bütün bilişsel ifadelerin %20,96'sı) yer almaktadır. En çok işlenen bilişsel beceri, dijital okuryazarlık ve analitik düşünme becerileridir. Eleştirel düşünme becerisi ve sorgulayıcı öğrenme becerileri sadece 5'er ifade ile ders kitaplarında yer almıştır. Ders kitaplarında gelişen teknolojilerin, özellikle iletişim teknolojilerinin, birey ve toplum hayatındaki artan önemine paralel bir şekilde bazı becerilerin ders kitaplarında ağırlıklı olarak yer aldığı belirlenmiştir.

Vatandaşlık kategorisinde ders kitaplarında toplamda 98 ifade (Bütün bilişsel ifadelerin %17,25'i) yer almaktadır. İfadelerin daha çok haklar ve ödevler ve uluslararası hukuk metinlerinden doğan haklar konularında olduğu görülmektedir. Ders kitaplarında temel haklara, ilgili uluslararası hukuk metinleri ile ilişkisi kurulmaksızın, yer verilmiştir. (MEB, t.y., s.169). Aktarımlar vatandaşlık haklarının sadece egemen devletlerle ilgili olduğunu düşündürse de, ülkemizde hukuk sisteminin vereceği kararların bireylerce yanlış olduğu düşünüldüğünde Avrupa İnsan Hakları Mahkemesine başvuruabileceklerinin belirtildiği ifade de 6.sınıf ders kitabında yer almaktadır (MEB, 2019b, s.203). Dünyada vatandaşlık kavramının gelişimi ve değişimi tarihsel bir seyir içinde 7.sınıf ders kitabında anlatılmıştır. Vatandaşlık kavramının gelişimi hakkında bilgi verildiği halde, günümüzdeki vatandaşlık anlayışları ise ders kitaplarında yer almamıştır.

Sosyal Bilgiler Ders Kitaplarında UNESCO'nun Küresel Vatandaşlık Eğitimi Anlayışının Sosyo-Duygusal Boyutunun İncelenmesi

Sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında sosyo-duygusal boyut toplamda 405 ifade ile yer almıştır.

Kimlik bilinci kategorisinde toplamda 278 ifade (Sosya-Duygusal boyutun %68,64'ü) yer almaktadır. Bu kategori ders kitaplarında sosyo-duygusal boyutta en fazla ifadenin olduğu kategoridir. Bireysel kimlik bilincinin çoklu ilişkilerde konumu alt kategorisinde ders kitaplarında toplam 34 ifade belirlenmiştir. Birey için belirlenmiş olan tutum ve davranışların bireyin rolleri olarak tanımlanması ve kendilerinden beklenen davranışları sergilemesi gereği 6.sınıf ders kitabında ayrıntılı bir şekilde yer almıştır (MEB, 2019b, s.12).

Toplumsal kimlik bilincinin çoklu ilişkilerde konumu alt kategorisinde ders kitaplarında toplam 19 ifade belirlenmiştir. Ulusal kimlik bilincinin çoklu ilişkilerde konumu alt kategorisi 103 ifade ile bu kategoride en fazla ifadenin yer aldığı alt kategori olmuştur.

Küresel kimlik bilincinin çoklu ilişkilerde konumu alt kategorisinde ders kitaplarında toplamda 12 ifade belirlenmiştir. Sınırlarımız dışındaki kültür ve medeniyetlerin 4.sınıf ders kitabında olumlu ifadelerle yer alması önemlidir.

İnsani konularda bakış açısı geliştirme alt kategorisinde ders kitaplarında toplam 53 ifade belirlenmiştir. Kültür ve medeniyetteki devamlılık özellikle bilim ve teknolojiadaki gelişimler aktararak 4.sınıf ders kitabında yer almıştır (MEB, 2019a, s.98). Bu aktarımlar günümüz medeniyetinin gelişiminin anlaşılması ve tek bir kişi ya da kültüre mal edilmemesi açısından olumlu bir yaklaşım olarak dikkat çekmektedir.

Kimlikler arası ilişkiler alt kategorisinde ders kitaplarında toplamda 13 ifade belirlenmiştir. Dini kimliklerin karşılaşmalarını aktaran ifadeler 7.sınıf ders kitabında yer almaktadır (MEB, 2019c, s.65). Kimlikler arası ilişki biçimleri alt kategorisinde ise ders kitaplarında toplamda 22 ifade belirlenmiştir.

Tutum ve değerler kategorisinde ders kitaplarında toplamda 90 ifade (Sosya-Duygusal boyutun %22'22'si) yer almaktadır. Farklılık ve çeşitliliğe yönelik tutum ve değerler alt kategorisinde toplamda 68 ifade bulunmaktadır. Bu alt kategoride; dil, din, ırk ve cinsiyet ayrımına 4.sınıf ders kitabında kesin ifadelerle karşı çıkmaktadır (MEB, 2019a, s.29). Önyargılarla mücadele (MEB, 2019b, s. 32) ve önyargıların sebep olduğu istenmeyen davranışlar 6.sınıf ders kitabında ifade edilmiştir (MEB, 2019b, s. 27). Kapsayıcılık, ders kitaplarında en fazla yer alan kod kelimelerden birisidir. Özellikle dini kimlikle bağlantılı olarak "bir arada yaşam" (MEB, 2019c, s. 37), ya da geçmiş örneklerle, Osmanlı İmparatorluğundaki "Millet" sistemi ve çok kültürlülük (MEB, 2019c, s. 62) ile vakıfların din, dil, ırk, düşünce farkı gözetmeden yaptıkları yardımlar (MEB, 2019c, s. 169) ile kapsayıcılık 7.sınıf ders kitabında yer almaktadır.

Farklılıklara ve çeşitliliğe ilişkin farkındalık alt kategorisinde ders kitaplarında toplamda 6 ifade yer almaktadır. Bu farkındalığı oluşturabilmek için farklılıkların nedenleri bireylerden toplumlara aktarılan bir anlatımla yer almıştır. (MEB, 2019a, s. 193), Farklılıklara ve çeşitliliğe açık olma alt kategorisinde ise ders kitaplarında toplamda 16 ifade belirlenmiştir.

Sosyal beceriler kategorisinde toplamda 37 (Tüm Sosyo-duygusal boyuttaki ifadelerin %9,14'ü) ifade ders kitaplarında yer almaktadır. İletişim becerisi 18 ifade, empati becerisi de toplamda 9 ifade ile en fazla belirlenen sosyal becerilerdir.

Sosyal Bilgiler Ders Kitaplarında UNESCO'nun Küresel Vatandaşlık Eğitimi Anlayışının Davranışsal Boyutunun İncelenmesi

Sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında toplamda 64 ifade "Aktif Vatandaşlık" kategorisinde yer almaktadır. Bireysel katılım yerel alt kategorisinde toplamda 14 ifade belirlenmiştir. Sistem ve yapıların bireylerin hak arama eylemlerindeki yeri ve önemi 6.sınıf ders kitabında aktarılmıştır (MEB, 2019b, s.40).

Kolektif katılım yerel alt kategorisinde ders kitaplarında sadece 6 ifade belirlenmiştir. İfadeler bireysel katılım yerel alt kategorisinde belirlendiği gibi, bireylerin başlattıkları eylemleri değil, bireylerin katılımcı oldukları eylemleri 4.sınıf ders kitabında aktarmıştır (MEB,2019a, s. 27).

Kolektif katılım ulusal alt kategorisinde ders kitaplarında sadece 9 ifade belirlenmiştir. İstiklal Harbi sürecinde ulus olarak yapılanların aktarıldığı ifadeler bu alt kategoride

değerlendirilmiştir (MEB, 2019a, s. 57). İfadeler hem örnek davranışları, hem de bireylerin dünyayı düzeltebilmek için yapabilecekleri eylemleri aktarmaktadır.

Kolektif katılım küresel alt kategorisinde ders kitaplarında 15 ifade belirlenmiştir. İfadeler genel olarak STK'ların çalışmalarını 4.sınıf ders kitabında aktarmaktadır (MEB, 2019a, s. 123). Ulusal ve küresel sistemlerin işbirliği 5.sınıf ders kitabında yer almaktadır (MEB, t.y., 28). Ulusal düzeyde siyasi katılım alt kategorisinde ders kitaplarında 9 ifade belirlenmiştir. Siyasi katılım, 6.sınıf ders kitabında seçimlere katılımın önemi vurgulansa da (MEB, 2019b, s.210), ders kitaplarında siyasi katılım, seçimlerle sınırlanmaksızın da yer almaktadır. 6.sınıf ders kitabında darbe girişiminin halkın eylemleri ile önlenmesi (MEB, 2019b, s.209) ile bireysel katılımın, ulusal boyuttaki önemi vurgulanmıştır. STK'lar, medya ya da kamuoyu oluşturmanın siyasi katılımındaki önemi ise 6.sınıf ders kitabında aktarılmıştır (MEB, 2019b, s.204). Yerel düzeyde etik davranış alt kategorisinde ders kitaplarında 3 ifade belirlenmiştir.

Ulusal düzeyde etik davranış alt kategorisinde ders kitaplarında 3 ifade belirlenmiştir. İfadeler, fikir, düşünce, sanat eseri gibi eserlerin korsan kullanımına karşı farkındalık oluşturabilmeyi hedeflemektedir (MEB, 2019b, 151). Örnek olma alt kategorisinde ise ders kitaplarında 5 ifade belirlenmiştir.

Sosyal Bilgiler Ders Kitaplarında UNESCO'nun Küresel Vatandaşlık Eğitimi Anlayışının Boyutlara Göre Dağılımın İncelenmesi

4, 5, 6 ve 7. sınıf sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında % 54,77'lik oranla en fazla küresel vatandaşlık eğitiminin bilişsel boyutuna yer verildiği, bu boyutu % 39,05'lik bir oranla sosyo-duygusal boyutun takip ettiği görülmektedir. Davranışsal boyut ise (%6.17'si) küresel vatandaşlık eğitiminin sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında en az yer verilen boyutu olmuştur. Bu bulgulara göre sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarının UNESCO'nun küresel vatandaşlık eğitimi anlayışının daha çok bilişsel ve sosyo-duygusal boyutlarını desteklediği, ancak davranışsal boyutunu çok fazla desteklemediği söylenebilir.

Tartışma ve Sonuç

Sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında bilişsel boyutta en fazla ifadenin yer aldığı kategori "konu ve sorunlar" kategorisi olmuştur. Ders kitapları incelendiğinde ulusal konu ve sorunların ağırlıklı olarak aktarıldığı; yerel ve küresel konu ve sorunlarla ilgili aktarımların daha az olduğu görülmektedir. İncelenen tüm sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında yerel/ulusal/küresel konu ve sorunlar daha çok tanımlama düzeyinde aktarılmış olup nedenler ve çözüm önerilerine yönelik ifadeler ders kitaplarında çok az yer almıştır. Oysaki GCED; paradigmasına göre bireylerin yerel, ulusal ve küresel konuların, yapıların ve süreçlerin birbirleri ile olan bağlılıklarını fark etmeleri, günümüz konu ve sorunlarının; küresel konu ve sorunlarla ve var olan sistem ve yapılarla ilişkilerini sorgulamaları beklenmektedir. NCSS insan deneyiminin; insanların sürekli olarak ulus ötesi, kültürler arası, çok kültürlü, çok etnikli etkileşimlerden etkilendiğini ve giderek küreselleşen bir fenomen olduğunu belirterek bu etkileşime vurgu yapmaktadır (NCSS, tarih yok). Ders kitaplarında GCED ve NCSS tarafından belirtilen öncelikler konu ve sorunların aktarımlarında tespit edilememiştir.

Sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında konular ve sorunlar arasındaki etkileşim ve bağlılıklar; kültürü etkileyen küresel değişimlerle, güçlenen popüler kültürün neden olduğu olumsuzluklarla

ve mülteciler ile aktarılmıştır. Güncel Covid-19 salgını sistem ve yapıların, konu ve sorunlarla olan ilişkilerini göstermesi açısından önemlidir. Salgın, daha önce dikkatimizi çekmeyen küresel kurumların varlıklarını, günümüz dünyasındaki önemini ve ulus devlet sınırlarını aşan konu ve sorunlardaki rollerini de hatırlatmıştır.

Sosyal bilgiler ders kitapları incelendiğinde sistem ve yapılar kategorisinde en çok ifadenin olduğu alt kategorinin ulusal sistemler ve yapılar olduğu en az ifadenin olduğu alt kategorinin ise yerel sistemler ve yapılar olduğu görülmektedir. Sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında sistemler ve yapılarla ilgili olan ifadeler daha çok tanımlama düzeyinde kalmıştır. Sistem ve yapıların sorunları hakkında ise çok az ifade bulunmaktadır. Bu durum yerel/ulusal ve küresel sistem ve yapıların kuruluş amaçlarını tarihsel süreç içinde ne kadar yerine getirebildikleri ve neden yeteri kadar bu amaçlarını gerçekleştiremedikleri hakkında öğrenenlerin bir sorgulama yapmasına izin vermemektedir.

Ders kitapları incelendiğinde sistem ve yapılar arasındaki etkileşimler ve bağlılıkların yeterli düzeyde aktarılmadığı görülmüştür. Küresel sistem ve yapıların, ülkemizde ulusal sistem ve yapılarla işbirliği içerisinde yaptıkları çalışmaların bazılarında küresel sistem ve yapılar atıf yapılmaksızın ders kitaplarında yer almaktadır. Sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında sistemler ve yapılar arasındaki etkileşimlerin ve bağlılıkların yer aldığı çok az ifade belirlenmiştir. Dünyanın bir yerinde alınan kararların, insanların ve çevrenin mevcut ve gelecekteki refahını nasıl etkileyebilir? Bu soru ve sorunun cevaplarının düşünülmesi küresel vatandaşlık eğitiminin öğrenme hedeflerinden birisidir (UNESCO, 2015, s.32). Sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında bu soruya cevap aranmamış, sadece bazı uluslararası sözleşmelerin etkilerinden bahsedilmiştir.

Etkileşim ve bağlılık kategorisinde sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında en fazla ifadenin yer aldığı alt kategori “küresel değişimlerin insanlar üzerindeki etkileri” alt kategorisidir. “Yerel/ulusal ile küresel sistemler arasındaki etkileşim ve bağlılık” ile “yerel/ulusal ile küresel konular/ sorunlar arasındaki etkileşim ve bağlılık” alt kategorilerinde yer alan ifadeler ise sınırlı kalmıştır. Bu durum öğrencilerin sosyal bilgiler dersinde küresel vatandaşlık konularını bağlam temelli olarak öğrenmelerini engellemektedir.

Ders kitaplarında ortak mirasa, küresel barışa vurgu yapılmış olmasına rağmen küresel dünya ile etkileşimler ulus-devlet bakış açısıyla değerlendirilmiştir. Toplumların ve kültürlerin karşılaşmaları sadece savaşlar ve çatışmalar üzerinden aktarılmıştır. Küresel sistem ve yapıların, ulusal sistem ve yapılarla etkileşimleri ise çok az olarak bazı örnek olaylarda aktarılmıştır.

Sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında eleştirel düşünme ve sorgulayıcı öğrenme becerileri ile ilişkili olan ifadeler; medya okuryazarlığı, dijital okuryazarlık ve kısmen de teknoloji okuryazarlığı becerileri ile ilişkili olan ifadelere göre daha az yer aldığı görülmektedir. Nitekim Demir ve Özyurt (2021) sosyal bilgiler ders kitapları ve öğretim programının öğrencilerin 21.yüzyıl becerilerinin geliştirilmesine yönelik zenginleştirilmesi ve 21. yüzyıl becerileri açısından kapsayıcı bir nitelik kazandırılmasını önermektedir.

Araştırmanın bulgularına göre vatandaşlık kategorisinde sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında bireyin yasal ve anayasal haklarına, bireyin yasal ve anayasal ödevlerinden daha fazla yer verildiği tespit edilmiştir. Ders kitaplarında vatandaşlık kategorisinin alt kategorileri olan bireyin uluslararası gönüllü kuruluş ve organizasyonlarla ilişkisi, vatandaşlık yaklaşımları/benzerlikler

ve vatandaşlık yaklaşımları/farklılıklar alt kategorilerinde ise herhangi bir ifadeye rastlanmamıştır. Oysaki vatandaşlığın farklı tanımlarındaki benzerlikler ve farklılıklar GCED ile öğrenilmesi hedeflenen başlıklardan birisidir (UNESCO, 2015). Küresel vatandaşlık eğitiminde, sadece var olan haklar ve ödevlerin aktarımı yerine; farklı toplumlarda kurallar ve kararlardaki benzerlikler ve farklılıklar, bunları nasıl edindikleri ve sahiplendiklerinin (tarih, coğrafya, kültür dâhil olmak üzere) (UNESCO, 2015, s.32) öğrenilmesi amaçlanmaktadır. İncelenen sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında diğerlerini tanıma çabaları; günlük yaşam alışkanlıkları, belirli kültürel normlar ya da istisnai olarak inançlardaki farklılıkların aktarımları ile gerçekleştirilmiştir. Fakat farklı coğrafyalardaki vatandaşlık uygulamaları ve kazanımları hem tarihsel hem de güncel olarak açıklanmamıştır. Sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında temel hakların kazanım öyküleri ve uluslararası sözleşmeler ve kurumlarca korunduğu belirtilmiştir. Ancak, temel hakların sadece egemen devletlerin güvencesinde olmadığı, aynı zamanda “tüm insan topluluğunun bir bütün olarak” savunduğu ve küresel sistem ve yapılarla tüm dünyada, korunmak zorunda olduğu (Carter, 2005, s.26) gerçekliği ders kitaplarında yer almamaktadır. Sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında, temel hak ihlalleri konusunda küresel sistem ve yapılarla eleştirel bir yaklaşım da sergilenmemiştir.

Toplumsal bütünleşme sürecinin önemli bir unsuru olan kimlik hem Türkiye’de hem de dünyada sosyal bilgiler ders programlarında önemli bir yere sahiptir. Bu çalışmada sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında bireysel, toplumsal ve ulusal kimlik alt kategorilerinde dini kimliğin özellikle milli kimlikle özdeşleştirilerek aktarıldığı görülmektedir. Ayrıca ders kitaplarında popüler kültürün neden olduğu kültürel tek tipleşme ve kültürel yozlaşmaya karşı, dini kimlikle tanımlanan milli kimlik öğeleri öne çıkarılarak öğrencileri bilinçlendirme çabaları da gözlenmiştir. Bu sonuçlar Şen (2019)’in 2018 sosyal bilgiler dersi öğretim programını incelediği araştırmasında programın, geçmiş programlara kıyasla etno-dinsel bir milliyetçiliğe kaydığı sonucunu ders kitapları açısından da desteklemektedir.

Sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında kimlik, bireysel rollerin tanımlanması ile kazandırılmaya çalışılmıştır. Sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında; çeşitli ve farklı geçmişlere sahip insanlarla olumlu ilişkiler geliştirmek (UNESCO, 2015, s.35) ile ilgili ifadeler sınırlı sayıda yer almıştır. Kendi deneyimlerinin ötesinde farklı kültürler ve toplumlar ile farklı bakış açılarının değerinin (UNESCO, 2015, s.36) anlatıldığı ifadeler ise sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında belirli düzeyde yer almaktadır. Küresel vatandaşlık eğitiminde yer alan, farklı gruplara ait ve ilişkili olan çoklu kimlikler (UNESCO, 2015, s.35) sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında aktarılmıştır. Sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında; toplumlar ve kültürler arasındaki benzerlikleri ve farklılıkları anlama (inançlar, dil, gelenekler, din, yaşam tarzları, etnik köken) (UNESCO, 2015, s.36) çabalarının olduğu da görülmektedir.

Sosyal bilgiler ders kitapları incelendiğinde en eski medeniyetlerden başlayarak günümüze kadar medeniyetlerin birbirlerini etkiledikleri aktarılmıştır. Bu etkileşim sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında ortak miras vurgusu ve günümüzdeki somut varlığı ile açıklanmıştır. Yakın çevremizin ötesinde ve farklı yöntemlerle (medya, seyahat, müzik, spor, kültür) daha geniş dünyaya nasıl bağlıyız? (UNESCO, 2015, s.35) Sorusuna verilen cevaplar genel olarak çatışmalar, ticaret ve turizm odaklı olarak verildiği görülmüştür. Ortak bir kimlik potansiyeli (ortak insanlığa aidiyet duygusu, farklılıklara ve çeşitliliklere saygı) anlayışı kazandırılma hedefi sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında ortak mirasa verilen önem ile sınırlı bir şekilde yer almaktadır.

Ders kitaplarında, tutum ve değerler kategorisinde en fazla ifadenin yer aldığı alt kategori farklılık ve çeşitliliğe yönelik tutum ve değerler alt kategorisidir. Ders kitaplarında diğerlerini tanıma, kapsayıcı olma, yardımlaşma, saygı ve empati en sık karşılaşılan ve küresel vatandaşlık eğitiminde de hedeflenen tutum ve değerler olarak karşımıza çıkmaktadır. Ülkemizde artan mülteci nüfusunun 2018 sosyal bilgiler dersi öğretim programını etkilediği düşünülmektedir. Kapsayıcı olma, farklılıklara saygı, kalıp ve önyargı ile mücadele etme, geçmiş dönemlerdeki dini kimliğimizle gösterilen hoşgörü ve barış içinde birlikte yaşama deneyimleri, bireysel farklılıklarla ilgili farkındalıkların toplumsal farklılıklar için de oluşturulma gayretleri ders kitaplarında yer almaktadır. Young (2016)'ın Güney Kore ders kitaplarını incelediği araştırmasında da benzer sonuçlar görülmektedir.

Araştırmada sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında her tür toplumsal baskıya direnme, şiddeti önleme, uzlaşma ve arabuluculuk, duygu yönetimi becerileri ile ilgili herhangi bir ifadeye rastlanmamıştır. Ders kitaplarında iletişim, empati ve girişimcilik becerilerinin diğer sosyal beceriler göre daha fazla olmasının nedeni olarak gelişen ve artan iletişim ve istihdam odaklı eğitim anlayışının olduğu düşünülmektedir.

Ders kitaplarında küresel vatandaşlık eğitiminin en az işlenen boyutu davranış boyutu olmuştur. Eyleme geçmeyen, davranışa dönüşmeyen bir öğrenmenin gerçek bir öğrenme olarak kabul edilmeyeceği düşünüldüğünde küresel vatandaşlık eğitiminin önemli bir boyutu olan davranışsal boyutun sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarının küresel vatandaşlık eğitimi açısından en zayıf noktası olduğu söylenebilir. Nitekim Türk ve Atasoy (2021)'da küresel vatandaşlık eğitimi açısından 2018 sosyal bilgiler dersi öğretim programını inceledikleri araştırmalarında kazanımların küresel vatandaşlığın boyutlarına göre dengeli bir şekilde dağılmadığını, davranış gerektiren küresel katılım boyutuna daha az vurgu yapıldığını tespit etmişlerdir.

Sonuç olarak, sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarında etkili bir küresel vatandaşlık eğitimi için küresel vatandaşlık eğitiminin her üç boyutunu da (Bilişsel, sosyo-duygusal, davranışsal) kapsayan içeriklerin dengeli bir şekilde dağılmasının faydalı olacağı düşünülmektedir. Ders kitaplarında konu ve sorunların küresel etkileşimleri ile yer almasının günümüz dünya sorunlarının daha iyi anlaşılmasına yardım edecektir. Ayrıca ders kitaplarında yerel, ulusal ya da küresel sistem ve yapıların; konu ve sorunlara yaklaşımları, verdikleri kararlar ve bu kararların uygulanma süreçlerine yönelik öğrencilerde eleştirel bir yaklaşım geliştirmelerini teşvik edecek içeriklerin yer alması gerekmektedir.